



## Pumkin-Shell for Mei Chatat

The fifth *perek* begins discussing different *keilim* that can be used to fill water for *mei chatat*; earthenware utensils, metal utensils and even the pumpkin-shell. The latter of the three is discussed separately since food readily expels absorbed liquids more than regular utensils (*Mishnah Achronah*). The first opinion cited in the third *Mishnah* is that if the pumpkin-shell was immersed in water that is not valid to be used for *mei chatat*, once it has been dried, it can still be used to contain the water for *mei chatat*. If however the pumpkin-shell became *tameh* and was then immersed it cannot be used. *R' Yosi* however disagrees, arguing that both the above cases should share the same ruling as there is no need for distinction. We shall try to understand the first opinion.

The *Eliyahu Raba* explains that in the first case, even though the invalid water might be expelled from the shell and mix with the acceptable water, it will occur at a slow rate – drop by drop. Those drops will be *batel* (annulled) in the majority acceptable water. Therefore there is no problem using the pumpkin-shell in that case to fill water for *mei chatat*. In the second case however, where the pumpkin-shell first became *tameh* and was then immersed, we are concerned that a single drop of *tameh* water might be expelled and even that small amount will cause the remaining water to become *tameh*.

The *Mishnah Achronah* explains *R' Yosi's* argument against the above distinction. It is true that in the first case, if a drop of invalid water is expelled and mixes with the other water, on a biblical level it is annulled in the majority. Even though ordinarily, for *mei chatat* we rule more stringently, since it is a doubtful whether any of the water will be expelled, it is permissible to use the pumpkin-shell. The same rationale is applicable to the second case as well. The

ability of *tameh* water to cause other water to be *tameh* is a rabbinic law! Consequently *R' Yosi* sees no reason to differentiate. The pumpkin-shell should not be used in either case.

The first opinion, explains the *Mishnah Achronah*, argues that in the first case, rabbinic stringency on not allowing the invalid water to be annulled in the valid water, is part of a brought sweeping stringency applied to anything involved in *mei chatat*. Consequently in our cases, the stringency is alleviated. The “stringency” that *tameh* water can affect other water is a stringency in the laws of *tumah* and *tahara*; it is rabbinic law. Consequently the first *Tana* does not rule leniently in that case.

Another point worth noting is that the *Rambam* appears to have a different text of our *Mishnah* (see *Tosfot Yom Tov*). In his it reads that if one immersed the pumpkin-shell in water appropriate for use for *mei chatat*, then the shell be used to fill water for *mei chatat*. According to what was learnt above, such a ruling would appear obvious. Why would one think otherwise?

To this the *Mishnah Achronah* explains that we learn that the water must be collected inside a *kli*. One might have thought that since the water became absorbed in the shell itself, it is as if the water has not been collected inside a *kli* and therefore invalid. The *Mishnah* is therefore teaching that even though the water is inside the walls of the *kli* it is still considered as if it is in the *kli* itself.<sup>1</sup>

*Yisrael Yitzchak Bankier*

<sup>1</sup> See the *Mishnah Achronah* for further analysis.

## Revision Questions

פרה ה': א' – ו': ה'

- How does one go about acquiring a *kli cheres* for the purpose of *mei chatat*? (ה': א')
- How does this differ to one that requires the *kli cheres* for *trumah*? (ה': א')
- What is the difference if one immerses a *kli shetef* in water fitting for *mei chatat* and water that is not fitting, for the purposes of filling it with *mei chatat*? (ה': ב')
- In what case is there no difference? (ה': ב')
- Explain the debate regarding when a hollowed out pumpkin can be used to contain the water for *mei chatat*? (ה': ג')
- Explain the debate in detail regarding a *shfoferet* that was made into a *kli* for the purpose of contain the *eifer chatat*. (ה': ד')
- Explain the debate regarding which three people cannot place the *eifer* in the water. (ה': ד')
- Are there any *keilim* in which *mei chatat* cannot be *mekadesh*? (ה': ה')
- Can the *kiddush* be performed if the water is on one's hands? (ה': ה')
- Which two laws regarding *tumah* and *tahara* apply only to *klei cheres*? (ה': ה')
- Can a clay shell be used for *kiddush mei chatat*? (ה': ו')
- Can an egg shell be used for *kiddush mei chatat*? (ה': ו')
- List five legal differences if a trough was carved in stone or formed from stone and then attached to the ground with plaster. (ה': ז')
- What difference does it make if a *shoket* was perforated at its base or side and in both cases were plugged with rags? (ה': ז')
- When does a clay rim invalidate an utensil for use in collecting water for *mei chatat*? (ה': ז')
- In which two cases where two troughs were carved in a detached stone, would *kiddush* in one affect the other? (ה': ח')
- Can two stones, that one brought together make a trough, be used to contain the water for *kiddush mei chatat*? (ה': ט')
- What is the law if the *eifer* fell into the *shoket*? (ה': י')
- What is the law if the *eifer* was removed and prior to placing it in the *shoket* the person closed the door to the room? (ה': י')
- When does standing the *shfoferet* upright prior to placing the *eifer* in the *shoket* not invalidate the *kiddush*? (ה': י')
- Explain the debate regarding whether *eifer* that was used to *mekadesh* some water can be reused for other water. What are the two cases discussed? (ה': יב')
- What is a *t'fi*? What is the law regarding the water in a *t'fi* that was fully immersed in the *shoket* during *kiddush*? (ה': יג')
- What is the law regarding a case where a sponge was found in the base of the *shoket*? (ה': יג')
- What substances can be used to guide water from a *ma'ayan* into a *kli* for it to be used for *mei chatat*? (ה': יד')
- Can water from a spring channelled into a cistern be use for *mei chatat*? (ה': יד')
- For what other cases does this law apply? (ה': יד')

## Local Shiurim

### Sunday -Thursday

After maariv  
Mizrachi Shul

### Friday & Shabbat

10 minutes before mincha  
Beit Ha'Roeh

## Next Week's Mishnayot...

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
15 <sup>th</sup> November כ"ח חשוון	16 <sup>th</sup> November כ"ט חשוון	17 <sup>th</sup> November ל' חשוון	18 <sup>th</sup> November א' כסלו	19 <sup>th</sup> November ב' כסלו	20 <sup>th</sup> November ג' כסלו	21 <sup>st</sup> November ד' כסלו
Parah 7:1-2	Parah 7:3-4	Parah 7:5-6	Parah 7:7-8	Parah 7:9-10	Parah 7:11-12	Parah 8:1-2

