



Korbanot on Yom Tov

One of the debates recorded between *Beit Shammai* and *Beit Hillel* relates to the *korbanot* one can bring on *Yom Tov* (2:4). *Beit Shammai* maintain can bring the *shalmei simcha* but not an *olat re'iya*. Nevertheless, *semicha* may not be performed on *yom tov* when offering the *shelamim*. The *Bartenura* explains that *semicha* involves resting one's hands on the *korban* and pressing down with full force. Consequently, the act involves making use of an animal, which is rabbinically prohibited on *yom tov*. Since *Beit Shammai* maintain that *semicha* may be performed prior to *yom tov*, it may not be performed on *yom tov*. *Beit Hillel* however disagree, arguing that both *korbanot* may be offered and *semicha* can be performed. With respect to *semicha*, the *Bartenura* explains the *Beit Hillel* maintain that *semicha* must be performed just prior to *shechita*. Consequently if the *shelamim* can be offered on *yom tov*, then *semicha* must also be performed on *yom tov*. We shall try to understand this debate.

The difference between an *olah* and *shelamim*, is that the *olah* offering is entirely burnt on the *mizbeach* whereas, other than the sacrificial parts, the *shelamim* is consumed by the owners. The *Bartenura* explains that since the *Torah* states that “*atzeret (Shemini Atzeret) shall be for you*” (*Bamidbar* 29:35), *Beit Shammai* maintain the only those actives that benefit the person are permitted. *Beit Hillel* however point to a different *pasuk*, “*atzeret for Hashem*” indicating that all *korbanot* are permitted. That said, the *Bartenura* concludes that while they debate regarding the *olah* and *shelamim* that are meant to be brought during the festival, everyone agrees that those *nedarim* and *nedavot* – voluntary offerings – may not be brought on *yom tov*.

The distinction between *shalmei simcha*, *olat re'iya* and *nedarim* and *nedavot* requires thought. *Rashi* (*Beitzah* 20b, s.v. *mideoraita*) explains that according to *Beit Hillel* the derivation of “for *Hashem*” only includes those *korbanot* that are like the *korban chagigah* that is mentioned in the *pasuk*. In other words, it only includes *korbanot* that one has an obligation to bring on *yom tov*, thereby excluding *nedarim* and *nedavot* that can be brought after the festival. *Rashi* also explains (19a s.v. *aval*) that even though the *shalmei*

chagigah and *olat re'iyah* can be brought during *chol ha'moed*, the *Chachamim* did not make one delay in case something else came up that would prevent one for offering the *korbanot*.

One might still ask why one is not allowed to offer *nedarim* and *nedavot*, considering that the parts of the *korban* are consumed by the owner and (many) *melachot* for the purpose of food are permitted on *yom tov*. The *Gemara* (21a) explains that “the *kohanim* merit [their share] by way of the *shulchan gavoah*” – from the *mizbeach*. *Rashi* (s.v. *kohanim*) explains that it is like a servant that receives his portion from his master. In other words, regarding *nedarim* and *nedavot*, it is considered as if the entire *korban* was offered for *Hashem*, only after which one may take some of the *korban* for consumption. Consequently, the activity cannot be permitted.

The *Riva* (*Tosfot, Shabbat* 24b, s.v. *lefi*) understands that despite their being some benefit, since the prime intent of the *korban* is *lagevoah*, it is not permitted (unless the *Torah* expressly allows it). The *Ri* however understands that since the act of *shechita* does not permit the animal (immediately) for human consumption (without offering the rest of the *korban*) it is not considered a *shechita* at all for human consumption. The *Avnei Miluim* (*Shut* 2) explains that this to mean that since none of the *korban* belongs to individual until after the blood is thrown, the *shechita* cannot be defined as one for *ochel nefesh* – for one's personal food benefit.¹

One final issue to address is raised by the *Tosfot R' Akiva Eiger*. One might ask, one can satisfy the obligation to have *shalmei simcha* with *nedarim* and *nedavot*, so why can they not be offered on *yom tov*. The *Tosfot R' Akiva Eiger* cites the *Tosfot* who answer that we are referring to where the *shamei simcha* have already been brought or one did not have the express intent to satisfy their obligation with the *nedarim* and *nedavot*.

Yisrael Bankier

¹ Based on this understanding the *Avnei Miluim* sides with the *Shav Yaakov* in prohibiting one for slaughtering the animal of a *nochri* on *yom tov* even

with the understanding that he will then receive a share of the meat. See the responsa inside.

Revision Questions

ביצה א' ר' - ב' ט'

- Explain the debate regarding taking *challah* to a *kohen* on *Yom Tov*. (א' ר')
- Does it matter when the *challah* was separated? (א' ר')
- Which *melachot* that are connected to *ochel nefesh* does *Beit Shammai* hold must be performed with a *shinui*? (א' ג' ח')
- What does *Beit Hillel* forbid from being sent on *Yom Tov*? (א' ט')
- Can one send *kilayim* garments to another on *Yom Tov* and why? (א' ג')
- Complete the following phrase: (א' ג')
"זוה הכלל: _____ - ביום טוב משלחן אותו."
- Other than making an *eiruv tavshilin*, how can one effectively cook on *Yom Tov* for *Shabbat*? (א' ב')
- What is required to make an *eiruv tavshilin*? (א' ב')
- Can one cook on *Yom Tov* for *Shabbat* if they ate their *eiruv tavshilin*? (א' ב')
- List the opinions of *Beit Shammai* and *Beit Hillel* regarding *tevilah* for *Yom Tov* when it falls on a Sunday. (א' ב')
- Which form of *tevilat keilim* is permitted on *Yom Tov*? (א' ג')
- Explain the debate regarding which *korbanot* can be brought on *Yom Tov*? (א' ד')
- What is different about the way *Beit Shammai* maintains that a *korban shlamim* is brought on *Yom Tov*? (א' ד')
- Is one allowed to heat water on *Yom Tov* for the purpose of washing his feet? (א' ה')
- In which three cases (relating to *Yom Tov*) does *Rabban Gamliel* rule stringently according to *Beit Shammai*? (א' ר')
- In which three cases does *Rabban Gamliel* rule leniently compared to the *Chachamim*? (א' ג')
- In which three cases does *R' Elazar ben Azarya* permit and the *Chachamim* prohibit? (א' ח')
- In which of those three cases does *R' Yehuda* take an intermediate position? (א' ח')
- Why can the three components of a pepper grinder each *mekabel tum'ah*? (Be specific) (א' ט')

Shiurim

ONLINE SHIURIM

Yisrael Bankier
mishnahyomit.com/shiurim

Rabbi Reuven Spolter
mishnah.co

Rabbi Chaim Brown
www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

Rabbi E. Kornfeld
Rabbi C. Brown
http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calendars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm

APPS

Mishnah Yomit
mishnahyomit.com

All Mishnah
Orthodox Union

Mishna Yomi
Our Somayach, South Africa

Kehati

SHIUR ON KOL HALOSHON

Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss
In US dial: 718 906 6400
Then select: 1 - 2 - 4

Next Week's Mishnayot...

| Sunday | Monday | Tuesday | Wednesday | Thursday | Friday | שבת קודש |
|-------------------|-------------------|--------------------|--------------------|--------------------|--------------------|--------------------|
| 30 July י"ב אב | 31 July י"ג אב | 1 August י"ד אב | 2 August ט"ו אב | 3 August ט"ז אב | 4 August י"ז אב | 5 August י"ח אב |
| Beitzah 2:10-3:1 | Beitzah 3:2-3 | Beitzah 3:4-5 | Beitzah 3:6-7 | Beitzah 3:8-4:1 | Beitzah 4:2-3 | Beitzah 4:4-5 |

