



## A Leak into a Barrel of Produce

The *Mishnah* (4:4) discusses a case where rainwater leaked into a house and filled a barrel of produce. The presence of the water was clearly not *le'ratzon* – the owner did not want it there. Therefore the produce would not affect *hechsher* and the produce would not be susceptible to *tumah*. The *Mishnah* continues by discussing how the water can be removed so that the produce would remain in that state.

*Beit Shammai* argue that the barrel must be smashed to drain the water. The *Beit Hillel* however explain that it can simply be poured out. We shall try to understand this debate.

The *Bartenura* understands that according to *Beit Shammai*, if one handles the barrel, the movement of the water will be intentional, which would then affect *hechsher*.

The *Rashash* continues that the debate would then be an extension of their other debate. We learnt previously (1:4) that if one shakes out a bundle of vegetables that got wet, *Beit Shammai* maintains that the movement of the water from one vegetable to next is intentional and would then affect *hechsher*. They maintain this position, even though the intention is to remove the water. *Beit Hillel* however disagree, since the intention is for none of the water to remain.

The *Eliyahu Raba* however explains that the debate is whether the barrel can be tipped to pour out the water.<sup>1</sup> *Beit Hillel* however would agree that the barrel cannot be lifted from ground in order to pour it out, since doing so would define the water as “drawn”. This explanation ties the position of *Beit Hillel* with a similar *Mishnah* in *Mikvaot* (2:7). Recall that a *mikveh* must be a natural collection of water. The *Mishnah* there discussed jugs that were left in an empty *mikveh* and filled with rain water. While the solution is debated, everyone agrees that if one picked up the

jugs, the water would be considered drawn and could not be used to fill the *mikveh*. The *Eliyahu Raba* appears to explain that even *Beit Hillel* would agree that in our case, if one picked up the barrel, it would then be considered “drawn” – willingly detached and effect *hechsher*.

The *Rambam* (*Tumat Ochlin* 2:7) however writes that one can pour out the water even though one wants the contents to be there until it is poured out.<sup>3</sup>

The *Chazon Ish* (*Machshirin* 3:2) explains that the *Rambam* has a different understanding of the debate. He first asks, if the owner tipped out the water instead of smashing the barrel, it does not necessarily mean that the water’s presence was the *le'ratzon* – the owner simply wanted to salvage the barrel. He therefore understands that according to *Beit Shammai* it is only considered *le'ratzon* if the barrel was moved to pour it out. If however it was tipped out there, even *Beit Shammai* would agree that it would not affect *hechsher*. *Beit Hillel* however argue that even if the barrel was transferred in order to pour it out, it would not affect *hechsher*. Why?

The *Chazon Ish* explains that according to the *Rambam*, *Beit Hillel* understand that the extended presence of the produce in the water is not considered *le'ratzon* as long as he is occupied with removing the water. Note that in the end of the *Mishnah*, if one removes the produce from the water, even though it takes longer than smashing the barrel, they are not susceptible to *tumah*. Consequently, according to *Beit Hillel* the presence of the water when taking it to be poured out, is not defined as *le'ratzon*. One should note however, that it would seem that if the person delayed in pouring out the water, *Beit Hillel* would agree that the produce would become susceptible to *tumah*.

**Yisrael Bankier**

<sup>1</sup> See also the *Mishnah Achrona* that provides a similar explanation.

### Revision Questions

מכשירין ג' ח' – ה' ג'

- What is the law regarding the water that drips off a wagon's wheel that was immersed in the river for hardening? (ח: ג')
- If one sent an animal to drink from a river, water dripping from which parts of the animal is considered "b'chi yutan"? (ח: ג')
- In which two cases does the law in the previous question change to be considered "b'chi yutan"? Never be considered b'chi yutan? (ח: ג')
- If one drank water from the river, is the water that drips from his beard considered b'chi yutan? (א: ד')
- In what case is the water on the outside of a barrel that was filled with water not considered b'chi yutan? (א: ד')
- If water falls on someone that is tameh, at what point is that water considered b'chi yutan? (ב: ד')
- In what similar case does that water become tameh earlier? (ב: ד')
- When is the water in a bowl that is placed outside when raining not considered b'chi yutan? (ג: ד')
- Explain the debate regarding what one should do if water collected in a barrel of fruit, if they do not want them to be susceptible to tumah. (ד: ד')
- In which case do they agree? (ד: ד')
- What are the two other similar cases where Beit Shammai and Beit Hillel argue? (Hint: trough.) (ה: ד')
- If one washes their clothes in a river, if water drips from which part of their body is there a debate regarding if it is considered b'chi yutan? (ה: ד')
- What is the law regarding a basket of turmosin that was (unintentionally) placed in a mikveh and a tameh person: (ו: ד')
  - Took one?
  - Touch the basket after it was removed from the mikveh? (ו: ד')
- What is the law regarding a radish that was washed in a ma'arah by a nidah? (ו: ד')
- What is the law regarding a case where produce fell in a stream and a person with tameh hands removed them? (ז: ד')
- How does the law change if the person intended to wash his hands when removing the produce? (ז: ד')
- What is the law regarding an earthenware utensil that was full of water and was placed in a mikveh and an av ha'tumah placed their hand in it? (ח: ד')
- How does the law change if the person was a maga tumah? If the kli cheres was filled with other liquids? (ח: ד')
- Explain the debate regarding how long it takes for water in a kilon to be considered b'chi yutan. (ט: ד')
- What is the law regarding water on stick that consisted of both poured and rain water? When does the law change? (י: ד')
- What is the law regarding wood that absorbed tameh liquid and rain fell on it? (י: ד')
- How should they be burnt? (י: ד')
- What is the law regarding the water on one who was pushed into a river? (Both cases.) (יא: ה')
- What is the law regarding water that is kicked up when swimming? That is deliberately splashed on one's friend? (ב: ה')
- Explain the debate regarding the water that fell on fruit and was mixed in order that it dries quicker. (ג: ה')

### Melbourne, Australia

**Sunday -Thursday**  
10 minutes before *Mincha*  
Mizrachi Shul  
Melbourne, Australia

**Friday & Shabbat**  
10 minutes before *Mincha*  
Mizrachi Shul  
Melbourne, Australia

### Efrat, Israel *Shiur in English*

**Sunday -Thursday**  
Rabbi Mordechai Scharf  
9:00am  
Kollel Magen Avraham  
Reemon Neighbourhood

### ONLINE SHIURIM

*Yisrael Bankier*  
mishnahyomit.com/shiurim

*Rabbi Chaim Brown*  
www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

*Rabbi E. Kornfeld*  
*Rabbi C. Brown*  
http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calend  
ars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm

### SHIUR ON KOL HALOSHON

*Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss*  
In US dial: 718 906 6400  
Then select: 1 – 2 – 4

### Next Week's Mishnayot...

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
24 October י"ח חשוון	25 October י"ט חשוון	26 October כ' חשוון	27 October כ"א חשוון	28 October כ"ב חשוון	29 October כ"ג חשוון	30 October כ"ד חשוון
Machshirin 5:4-5	Machshirin 5:6-7	Machshirin 5:8-9	Machshirin 5:10-11	Machshirin 6:1-2	Machshirin 6:3-4	Machshirin 6:5-6

