



Tashlumin for Shalmei Simcha

On the three *regalim* – *Pesach*, *Shavuot* and *Sukkot* – one is obligated to go to *Yerushalaim*¹ and offer two *korbanot* – *olat re'iya* and *shalmei chagigah*. While the obligation to offer these *korbanot* is on the first day, if one does not, then they have the next six days (or seven for *sukkot*) to offer them. The remaining days provide the opportunity for *tashlumin* – fulfilling the original obligation (1:6). Last cycle (Vol 8 Iss 49), we discussed the nature of *tashlimum*. There is another *korban* however that one must also bring during the *regel* – *shalmei simcha*. The difference with this *korban* is that one only needs to offer the *korban* if they are not consuming meat from a *korban* on that day. For example, we have learnt that if one brings a voluntary *shelamim* offering, or if a *kohen* eats the gifted parts of another's *korban*, then they are not required to bring a *shalmei simcha*. Does *tashlumin* also apply to *shalmei simcha*?

The *Bartenura* explains that the *Mishnah* that discusses *tashlumin* (1:6) is referring to the *olat re'iya* and *shalmei chagigah*, with no mention of the *shalmei simcha*. The *Tosfot Yom Tov* notes that this is also the opinion of the *Rambam* (see *Chagigah* 1:4). The *Tosfot Yom Tov* explains that since there is an obligation to bring a *shalmei simcha* every day, the concept of *tashlumin* is irrelevant.²

The *Tosfot* (6b, s.v. *yesh*) however maintain that *tashlumin* applies to the *shalmei simcha*. Assuming the *Tosfot Yom Tov*'s point that there is an obligation of *simcha* everyday, how can *tashlumin* apply according to the *Tosfot*?

The *Tzlach* (*Chagigah* 6b) notes that when the *Rambam* (*Chagigah* 1:1) discusses the obligation of *shalmei chagigah* he explains that *mitzvah* of *simcha* is to offer a *korban shelamim* in addition to the *shalmei chagigah*. The *Tzlach* notes that the *Rambam* does not disagree with *Mishnah* cited above. The *Rambam* (*Chagigah* 2:10) rules that one can fulfil the obligation of *shalmei simcha* through other voluntary offerings. Similarly, *kohanim* can fulfil their obligation when they eat parts of a *chatat*, *asham*, *bechor* or the *chaze* (breast) and *shok* (thigh) given to them from

another's *shelamim* offering. Nevertheless, the *Tzlach* explains that while one can fulfil the *mitzvah* of *simcha* by these other means, there is an obligation to at least once during the festival offer one *korban* for the purpose of the *shalmei simcha*. He adds that this can be fulfilled with another voluntary offering, provided that it is offered for the purpose of the *shalmei simcha*. Once it is offered, during the remaining days, there still exists the daily obligation of *simcha*, which can be fulfilled with the meat of any *korbanot*. Consequently, since there exists an obligation to specifically offer a *korban* for the *shalmei simcha* at least once (aside from the daily obligation of *simcha*) we can understand how the concept of *tashlumin* can apply to the *shalmei simcha*.

The *Avi Ezri* (*Chagiga* 2:10) provides a similar explanation. In addition, he cites the *Rambam* (*Yom Tov* 6:17) who rules that despite that fact the *mitzvah* of *simcha* is through a *korban shelamim*, encompassed in that *mitzvah* is to impart *simcha* on others. The *Avi Ezri* finds that while it is true there is a broad *mitzvah* of *simcha*, there is also a specific obligation to offer the *shalmei simcha*.

The *Avi Ezri* continues that this explains another comment of the *Tosfot*. The *Tosfot* asks why voluntary offering cannot be brought on *Yom Tov* if one can fulfil the obligation of the *shalmei simcha* through them. The *Tosfot* answer that one only fulfils the obligation if the voluntary offering was offered for the *shalmei simcha*. The *Avi Ezri* asks, why is intention important if one can fulfil the *mitzvah* of *simcha* by eating the meat of a *korban*? The *Avi Ezri* answers, based on our explanation thus far, that while through eating the meat of the *korban* fulfils the *mitzvah* of *simcha*, one does not fulfil the *mitzvah* of offering the *shalmei simcha* unless the *korban* was offered for that purpose. This explains why according to the *Tosfot*, the correct intention when offering a voluntary offering is critical when determining if it can be offered on *Yom Tov*. If at the time of *shechita* it is for the *shalmei simchei*, the *korban* is then defined as being for the purpose of *Yom Tov* and may be offered.³

Yisrael Bankier

¹ The first *Mishnah* discusses those who are not obligated in this *mitzvah*.

² See also *R' Akiva Eiger*.

³ Note that this is one side of the debate. Others argue that the obligation to offer the *shalmei Simcha* is every day, but only in the absence of the availability of meat from other *korbanot*. See *Aruch LaNer* (*Sukkah* 48a)

Revision Questions

מועד קטן ג: וי – טי

- What is different about a burial that occurs during *Chol Ha'moed*? (ג: וי)
- Why would they rest a coffin in the street? (ח: גי)
- Would they rest a coffin in the street during *Chol Ha'moed*? (ח: גי)
- For whom would they never rest the coffin in the street? (ח: גי)
- What is *inui*? (ט: טי)
- What is *kina*? (ט: טי)

חגיגה א' א' – ב' ג'

- Who is exempt from *Re'iyah*? (א: אי)
- What are the two opinions regarding the definition of a *katan* that is exempt from *Re'iyah*? (א: אי)
- What is the minimum value of a *korban Re'iyah* and a *korban Chagigah*? (Include both opinions) (ב: אי)
- Which *korban* can be brought using *ma'aser sheni* money? (ג: אי)
- On which day does *Beit Shammai* argue that the *korban* referred to in the previous question must be brought from *chulin* money? (ג: אי)
- Can an *Yisrael* fulfil his obligation of bringing *shalmei Simcha* by bringing *ma'aser behema*? (ד: אי)
- Can a *Kohen* fulfil his obligation of bringing *shalmei Simcha* by consuming the meat from an offered *chatat*? (ד: אי)
- What are the four different groupings that determine the required value of the *korban Re'iyah* and the *shalmei Chagigah*? (ה: אי)
- If someone did not bring the *korban Re'iyah* during the festival can he bring it at a later date? (ו: אי)
- What are the additional two opinions about who the following *pasuk* refers to: (ז: אי)
 "מעות לא יוכל לתקן, וחסרון לא יוכל להמנות"
- Which *halachot* are described as: "הררים התלויין בשערה"? (ח: אי)
- What topic should only be taught one-to-one? (ט: אי)
- A person who inquires into which four things is described as: "ראוי לו כאלו" (ב: אי)
 "לא בא לעולם"
- Who else is described in such a manner? (א: ב)
- With regards to which process in the offering of a *korban* on *Yom Tov* did five groups of *Tana'im* debate? (ב: ב)
- Which personal *korban* did *Beit Shammai* argue cannot be brought on *Yom Tov*? (ג: ב)
- What was different about the way *Beit Shammai* and *Beit Hillel* allowed a *korban Shlamim* do be brought on *Yom Tov*? (ג: ב)

Melbourne, Australia

Sunday -Thursday
 10 minutes before *Mincha Mizrachi Shul*
 Melbourne, Australia

Friday & Shabbat
 10 minutes before *Mincha Mizrachi Shul*
 Melbourne, Australia

Efrat, Israel
Shiur in English

Sunday -Thursday
 Rabbi Mordechai Scharf
 9:00am
Kollel Magen Avraham
 Reemon Neighbourhood

ONLINE SHIURIM

Yisrael Bankier
mishnahyomit.com/shiurim

Rabbi Chaim Brown
www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

Rabbi E. Kornfeld
Rabbi C. Brown
<http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calendars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm>

SHIUR ON KOL HALOSHON

Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss
 In US dial: 718 906 6400
 Then select: 1 – 2 – 4

Next Week's Mishnayot...

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
21 January ה' שבט	22 January ו' שבט	23 January ז' שבט	24 January ח' שבט	25 January ט' שבט	26 January י' שבט	27 January י"א שבט
Chagigah 2:4-5	Chagigah 2:6-7	Chagigah 3:1-2	Chagigah 3:3-4	Chagigah 3:5-6	Chagigah 3:7-8	Yevamot 1:1-2

