Volume 9. Issue 15



# **Violating Daat Moshe**

The *Mishnah* lists certain cases where a woman can lose her *ketubah* (7:6). One group of cases is where she violates *Daat Moshe*. This consists of a number of serious biblical violation which she caused her husband to violate by lying to him, including *tevel*, *niddah* and *challah*.

Ostensibly there are two ways to understand the reason why she loses her *ketubah*. Either it is a fine for her causing her husband to transgress or it simply because he can longer trust her and they can not live together.<sup>1</sup>

A debate that is relevant to our discussion is what if the husband decides not to divorce his wife despite what she did? The *Rambam* rules (*Ishut* 24:16) that she has lost her *ketubah* nonetheless. He explains that *ketubah* was institute to protect the woman so that the husband would not readily divorce her. The *Rambam* adds that it was instituted however to protect the *tznu'ot* (modest) and not the wife as described in our *Mishnah*. Put simply, the *ketubah* does not apply to her. The *Ritva* however maintains that if the husband decides to stay with his wife then she keeps her *ketubah*.

The *Rosh* states explicitly that the a violation of *Daat Moshe* only causes her to lose her *ketubah* if she causes him to violate these prohibitions or any other such prohibitions, e.g. she feeds him *chelev* or blood. If however she transgressed these prohibitions herself then she does not lose her *ketubah*.

The *Chatam Sofer* understands that the reason she loses her *ketubah* is due to the loss of trust. The *Kovetz Shiurim* understands this from the *Rosh* as cited above. Since it only relates to cases where she causes him to violate, it appears to hinge on the lost of trust. He brings a further proof from *R' Meir's* ruling. One of the other violations in *Daat Moshe* is if she makes *nedarim* and does not keep them. Even though this appears to a personal transgression, it has dire consequences on the children. *R' Meir* suggests that he should provoke her to make a *neder* and then annul it in order that he can continue to live with her. Such a solution would only be affective if the concern was regarding the future and not a past transgression.

The *Beit Yaakov* however understands that the simple understand of the *Mishnah* is that she loses her *ketubah* regardless if we learn that she has since done *teshuva*. Furthermore, the *Rishonim* teach that she only loses her *ketubah* if she warned prior to the violation. If the reason is suspicion then the prior warning does not make sense. Furthermore the *Shulchan Aruch* rules that one cannot rely on another that is suspected of violating the prohibition themselves. Finally he argues that the fact that the *Rosh* specifically limits it to when she causes him to sin means it must be *kenas*. Adequate suspicion would be aroused if she personally violated the prohibition.<sup>2</sup>

<sup>2</sup> The *Tosfot HaRid* and *Shita Mekubetzet* also understand that the lose of *ketubah* is due to *kenas*.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The content of this article was gleaned from *Metivta*, *Yalkut Bi'urim*, *Ketubot* 72a.

### **Revision Questions**

כתובות זי וי טי אי

- When does a women lose here *ketubah*? (*i*): '*i*)
- What is *dat moshe*? (*i*: *i*)
- What is *dat yehudit?* (*i*): (*i*)
- What is a *kolanit?* (*i*: *i*:)
- Which *mumin* are problematic if they were concealed from the husband prior to marriage? (*i*: *i*)
- When does the law mentioned in the previous question no longer apply? (*r*: *n*)
- If the family claims that the *mum* developed after *eirusin* on who is the burden of proof? ('n: 'n)
- What is the law when *mumin* develop on the husband after marriage? (*v*: *v*)
- For which *mumin* developing on the husband is there agreement that the husband must divorce his wife? (1): (3)
- Is there any restriction placed on a woman who inherits property: (תי:אי)
  - Prior to marriage?
  - After *kidushin*?
  - After *nisuin*?
- How does R' Shimon differentiate between property that, if sold by the wife after marriage, the husband may reclaim it from the buyers and property that the husband may not reclaim? (':e:'))
- What is done with the following items that a wife inherits: (חי: גי)
  - Money?
  - Picked/detached fruit?
  - Unpicked fruit?
- Complete the following phrase and explain: (יחי :די)

\_\_\_\_\_ יירבי שמעון אומר : מקום שיפה כוחו בכניסתה \_\_\_\_ יירבי מקום שהורע כוחו בכניסתה \_\_\_\_ מקום שהורע כוחו

- What is done with the following items that a wife inherits: (חי:הי)
  - Elderly servants?
  - Old vines?
- When can a husband claim the expenses paid on *nichsei melog*? (חי: הי)
- Are there any restrictions placed on a *shomeret yabam* on the sale of property she inherits? (n: 'n)
- Explain the opinions of *Beit Shammai* and *Beit Hillel* regarding what is done with the property of a *shomeret yabam* that dies? (n: :n)
- What is done with the *shomeret yabam*'s original husband's: (ח: :זי)
  - Money?
    - o Picked/detached fruit?
    - Unpicked fruit? (Explain both opinions.)
- Can the *yabam* set aside money for the *yavamah*'s *ketubah* in order to seize possession of his late brother's property? (*n*:*n*)
- What is the impact of the following statements made by a husband prior to marriage: (אי: אי)
  - o יידין ודברים אין לי בנכסיך״?
  - יידין ודברים אין לי בנכסיך ובפירותיהן״?
  - o אין לי בנכסיך ובפירותיהן ובפרי ברותיהן, בחיין ובמותך״?

### Local Shiurim

#### Melbourne, Australia

Sunday -Thursday 10 minutes before *Mincha* <u>Mizrachi Shul</u> Melbourne, Australia

Friday & Shabbat 10 minutes before *Mincha* <u>Beit Ha'Roeh</u> Melbourne, Australia

> **Efrat, Israel** *Shiur in English*

Sunday -Thursday Rabbi Mordechai Scharf 9:00am Kollel Magen Avraham Reemon Neighbourhood

#### **ONLINE SHIURIM**

*Rabbi Chaim Brown* www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

> Rav Meir Pogrow 613.org/mishnah.html

Rabbi E. Kornfeld Rabbi C. Brown http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calend ars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm

#### SHIUR ON KOL HALOSHON

Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss In US dial: 718 906 6400 Then select: 1 - 2 - 4

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
12 <sup>th</sup> August כ״ד אב	13 <sup>th</sup> August כ״ה אב	14 <sup>th</sup> August כייו אב	15 <sup>th</sup> August כ״ז אב	16 <sup>th</sup> August כייט אב	17 <sup>th</sup> August לי אב	18 <sup>th</sup> August א׳ אלול
Ketubot 9:2-3	Ketubot 9:4-5	Ketubot 9:6-7	Ketubot 9:8-9	Ketubot 10:1-2	Ketubot 10:3-4	Ketubot 10:5-6

## Next Week's Mishnayot...