



Volume 5. Issue 33

The Importance of “What, Where and When”

The last four *mishnayot* of the third *perek* of *Keritut* have a great deal in common. Two of the most obvious commonalities are the fact that all four try to use a “*kal vachomer*” (an inference from minor to major) to derive a specific *halacha* and that all four *mishnayot* are based on questions that *Rabbi Akiva* asked of other great *Torah* scholars such as *Rabban Gamliel*, *Rabbi Eliezer* and *Rabbi Yehoshua*.

However, a slightly deeper analysis will show that although all of these *mishnayot* are based on the questions of *Rabbi Akiva*, only one of them, the seventh *Mishnah* of the *perek*, gives the exact time and place of the question. The *Mishnah* states:

Rabbi Akiva said: I asked *Rabban Gamliel* and *Rabbi Yehoshua* in the animal market of *Ama'om* as they were going to purchase an animal for the wedding feast of *Rabban Gamliel's* son...”

What is the relevance of this seemingly superfluous information? Why is it mentioned in this *Mishnah* and not in any of the following three?

Tosfot answer that even though all parties involved were pre-occupied with the preparation of a wedding feast and its many intricate details, they were still busying themselves with learning *Torah*. Clearly this is an important message for all of us. On this point, I remember walking home from *shul* with the *Rabbi Abranok ZT”L* and listening to him expound on the *parsha* and other aspects of learning throughout the entire journey.

The *Tiferet Yisrael* learns a number of other lessons from this episode. Looking at the place where the question was asked – the market place – we notice that it was not a private home or a *beit midrash* but rather a very public place, filled with many people. *Tiferet Yisrael* explains that despite this fact and despite the fact that *Rabban Gamliel* was the *Nasi* and *Rabbi Yehoshua* the *Av Beit Din*, they were not embarrassed to admit that they did not hear of any *halacha* relating to *Rabbi Akiva's* question.

Finally, the *Tiferet Yisrael* explains that the place and time are in fact very relevant to the question being asked. In the seventh *Mishnah*, *Rabbi Akiva* asks about *arayot* (forbidden relationships) and as we know from the timing of the question, *Rabban Gamliel* and *Rabbi Yehoshua* were preparing for a wedding feast – a feast in which we say the *bracha* “and that we were commanded about the *Arayot*” as part of the *Sheva Brachot*. In addition, *Rabbi Akiva's* second question, in the eighth *Mishnah* deals with animals and as we know from the place of the question, all three *Rabbi's* were in a marketplace specifically dedicated to the sale of animals. *Rabbi Akiva's* questions were therefore somewhat related to the matter at hand.

We see from these explanations that we should not only learn from the words of our *Rabbis* and teachers, but also from their deeds and actions. From where they go, why they go there and what they do when they are there.

Rabbi Ben-Zion Hain

Revision Questions

כריתות ג' ז' – ה' ז':

- How is it possible for a person to have a relationship with one person who is their sister, father's sister and mother's sister and what is the law in such a case? (ג' ז')
- What case is brought from which the *tumah* status of an *eiver medulda* is derived? (ח' ג')
- What are the two understandings of the question that *Rabbi Akiva* asked, which *R' Yehushua* attempted to derive the answer from the case of "five *tamchui'im*"? Explain. (ט' ג')
- Regarding the previous question how did *R' Akiva* respond? (י' ג')
- How did *R' Eliezer* answer *R' Akiva's* question regarding one that performs many *melachot* (*be'shogeg*) on many *Shabbatot* and how did *R' Akiva* respond? (יא' ג')
- When is one required to bring an *asham talui*? (יב' ז')
- What are the similarities regarding the obligation to bring a *chatat* and the obligation to bring an *asham talui*? (יג' ז')
- What are the four opinions regarding the debate between *R' Yehoshua* and *R' Eliezer* about the level of knowledge/intent that one must have in order to bring a *korban chatat*? (יד' ב-ג ז')
- If one consumed which specific blood are they punishable by *karet*? (Hard: what is the law regarding the other bloods listed?) (טו' ז')
- Explain the debate regarding whether one is obligated to bring an *asham talui* for *safek meilot*. (טז' ז')
- What was *R' Tarfon's* argument to *R' Akiva* regarding the previous question? (יז' ז')
- How did *R' Akiva* respond? (יח' ג')
- What is the law regarding a piece of *kodesh* meat and a piece of regular meat where: (יט' ז')
 - One person ate both?
 - Two people ate one each but it is not known which person ate the *kodesh* piece?
- What other case is brought that is similar to the previous question? (כ' ז')
- What is the law regarding the previous question if one piece was *kodesh* and the other *cheilev*? (כא' ז')
- What is the law if one piece was *cheilev* and the other *cheilev kodesh*? (כב' ז')

Local Shiurim

Sunday -Thursday

Between mincha & ma'ariv
Mizrachi Shul

Friday & Shabbat

10 minutes before mincha
Mizrachi Shul

Audio Shiurim on-line!

- 613.org/mishnah.html
- www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

Just Released!

Nachal Nove'ah *Nashim & Nezikim*

Nachal Nove'ah contains all the articles and revision questions that have been published for each *sefer* in one book.

Moed, *Nashim* and *Nezikim* are available. (*Zeraim* is out of print.)

Contact
admin@mishnahyomit.com
for more details

Next Week's Mishnayot...

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
14 th December י"ד כסלו	15 th December ט"ו כסלו	16 th December ט"ז כסלו	17 th December י"ח כסלו	18 th December י"ט כסלו	19 th December כ"א כסלו	20 th December כ"ב כסלו
Keritot 5:8- 6:1	Keritot 6:2-3	Keritot 6:4-5	Keritot 6:6-7	Keritot 6:8-9	Meilah 1:1-2	Meilah 1:3-4

