



Two Sides of a Plank

The *Mishnah* (12:3) discusses the case of a simple plank of wood placed on the top of a *tanur* (oven). Unlike in the earlier *Mishnah* (12:1), in this case the plank only over hangs the oven at its ends of the plank but not over its sides.¹ The *Mishnah* records a debate in this case where *tumat ha'met* was placed under one end, and objects or food was placed under the other. The *Chachamim* maintain that those objects are *tahor* whereas *R' Yossi* disagrees. We shall try to understand the debate.

The *Bartenura* explains that the *Chachamim* maintain that since the plank does not overhang on the sides, the *tumah* has no way of spreading to the other side. In other words, even though the plank is made of one material, the two sides are considered separate *ohalot*. *R' Yossi* however argues that the presence of the *tanur* in the middle cannot stop the *tumah* from passing to the other side.

The *Mishnah* states that the case involves an "old" *tanur*, meaning that it is susceptible to *tumah*. A point that is discussed is whether the plank is attached and sealed on top of the *tanur*, thereby protecting it from becoming *tameh*.

The *Tifferet Yisrael* maintains that that must be the case in order to understand the opinion of the *Chachamim*. Otherwise, the *tanur* itself would become *tameh* and not be able to stop the *tumah* from reaching the other side of the plank. That explains the *Chachamim*'s position. However, if the *tanur* is not susceptible to *tumah* how do we understand the position of the *R' Yossi*? The *Tifferet*

Yisrael explains that he understands that since the *ohalot* are made from one material, the presence of the oven between is ignored.

The *Mishnah Achrona* however explains that the *Mishnah* makes not mention that it is sealed. Furthermore, even if the plank is sealed, we have learnt that a *kli*, even if it is *tahor*, cannot *chotzet* – it cannot prevent the spread of *tumat ha'met*.

The *Mishnah Achrona* therefore suggest the plank is indeed sealed atop of the oven. This case however is different because the *tahor kli* is not above the *tumah*, but instead potentially preventing its sideward spread. The debate between the *Chachamim* and *R' Yossi* then is whether the limitation that a *tahor kli* cannot *chotzet* is only when the *kli* is above or also from the side.

The *Tifferet Yisrael* (*Boaz* 12:3) also addresses this question. He explains that the reason why a *kli* that is sealed and *tahor* cannot *chotzet* when it is between the *tumat ha'met* and the *kli* that is above it is because we ignore its presence – it is as if it is not there. Consequently, the *tumah* and *tahor* object are viewed as being over one another. In our case however, if you do the same and view the oven along with the parts of the plank that is sealed to it as not present, then there is no longer a single plank that is covering the source of *tumat ha'met* and the objects on the other side.



Yisrael Bankier

¹ See volume 12 Issue 26 where we discussed that *Mishnah* in more detail.



REVISION QUESTIONS

אהלות י'ז – י"ב:ד'

- Regarding the previous case, what is the law if the utensil was placed under the lintel? (י'ז:ד')
- Explain the debate regarding a case where a house's roof was cracked along its width and *tumah* was found in the inner part of the house. (י"א:א')
- What is the law regarding a cracked *achsadra* where *tumah* is found on one side? (י"א:ב')
- Regarding the previous question, in which three cases listed would the law change? (י"א:ב')
- Explain the debate regarding a case where a person was lying under the crack of the *achsadra*. (י"א:א')
- Can folded clothing lying on the floor beneath the crack in the *achsadra* cause the *tumah* to transfer to the other side? (י"א:א')
- Regarding a case where a person is leaning out the window of a house over a *kever*, when is the ruling debated and when does everyone agree that the *tumah* is transferred into the house? (י"ד:א')
- Which other case is debated in a similar manner? (י"ד:א')
- Which further case that is similar to one referred to in the previous question is debated in a similar manner? (י"ד:א')
- What are the four opinions regarding a house where a dog that ate a *kezayit* from a corpse died and lay on the threshold of the house? (י"ז:א')
- How long after the dog ate the meat is it no longer a question? (י"ז:א')
- Regarding the previous question, what is the law regarding fish and birds? (י"ז:א')
- Explain the debate regarding the *chadut*, *menorah* and *chafisa*. (י"ח:א')
- In which case is there a debate? (י"ח:א')
- What is the law regarding *keilim* on the rim of the *chadut*? (י"ט:א')
- What is the law if *tumah* is found on the rim of the *chadut*? (י"ט:א')
- What is the law regarding *keilim* in the walls of the *chadut* if *tumah* is found in the house? (Include all three cases.) (י"ט:א')
- What is the law regarding *keilim* resting on a plank of wood that is placed over a new oven if *tumah* is found underneath the overhanging plank? (י"ב:ב')
- How does the law change if the oven was old? (י"ב:ב')
- What is the law regarding a case where a *srida* is placed tightly over an oven and *tumah* is found beneath the overhanging part? Inside the *tanur*? (י"ב:ב')
- Explain the debate regarding a case where a plank of wood is placed over an oven and only overhangs on two opposite sides and *tumah* is found under on side. (י"ב:ב')
- Explain the debate regarding a *b'tach*. (י"ב:ב')
- Explain the debate regarding a *sandel shel arisa*. (י"ב:ב')



ONLINE SHIURIM

Yisrael Bankier

mishnahyomit.com/shiurim

Rabbi Reuven Spolter

mishnah.co

Rabbi Chaim Brown

www.shemayisrael.com/mishnah/

Rabbi E. Kornfeld

Rabbi C. Brown

<http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calendars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm>



APPS

Mishnah Yomit

mishnahyomit.com

All Mishnah

Orthodox Union

Mishna Yomi

Ohr Somayach, South Africa

Kehati



KOL HALOSHON

Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss

In US dial: 718 906 6400

Then select: 1 – 2 – 4

NEXT WEEK'S MISHNAYOT

SUNDAY	MONDAY	TUESDAY	WEDNESDAY	THURSDAY	FRIDAY	שבת קודש
25 October • י"ד חשוון	26 October • ט"ו חשוון	27 October • ט"ז חשוון	28 October • י"ח חשוון	29 October • י"ח חשוון	30 October • ט"ט חשוון	31 October • כ' חשוון
Ohalot 12:5-6	Ohalot 12:7-8	Ohalot 13:1-2	Ohalot 13:3-4	Ohalot 13:5-6	Ohalot 14:1-2	Ohalot 14:3-4

Have a good Shabbos!