



Kometz in a Kli Sharet

Last week we learnt that the four *avodot* for a *mincha* offering was the *kemitzah*, placing it in a *kli sharet*, taking it to the *mizbeach* then offering it on the *mizbeach*. The *Mishnah* (3:4) records the debate regarding the case where the *kemitzah* was not placed in the *kli sharet*. The *Chachacmim* maintain that the *mincha* would be invalid, while *R' Shimon* disagrees. We shall try to understand *R' Shimon's* position.

The *Gemara* (26a) explains that *R' Shimon's* opinion is based on the *pasuk* that describes the *mincha* as a “*kodesh kadashim*, like a *chatat*, like an *asham*”. The *chatat* and *asham* are different in that the *kohen* places the blood of the *chatat* on side of the *mizbeach* using his finger, unlike the *asham* where the *kohen* uses a *kli* (vessel). Since the *mincha* offering is connected to both, one has the option to use either method. More specifically, *R' Yehuda* the son of *R' Chiya* explained that if he wanted to offer it like a *chatat* then he would need to use his right hand (much like the placement of the blood that requires the right finger). If he wished to use the *kli* then he could even use his left hand.

The *Griz* (stencil) finds this distinction important. Recall that according to *R' Shimon* the *korban* is valid when the *kemitzah* is not placed in the *kli*. Consequently, one might have thought that even if he placed it in the *kli* it would not be considered an *avodah*. Since it appears optional, one could even do half by hand and half with the *kli*. The only difference between the “*chatat*” and “*asham*” routes, is whether there is a limitation on which hand can be used.

The *Griz* however argues that this is not the case. He cites *Rashi* who explains that the connection to the *asham* teaches that if the *kometz* was “*kidesh* (sanctified) in the *kli sharet* then he can use his left hand, like with the *asham*”. The fact that *Rashi* uses the word *kidesh*, implies that it has a *din* (law) of *kabalah*. Furthermore, when the *Gemara* explains that if he wants to use his hand, *Rashi* explains that that is when it was not placed in the *kli sharet*. The implication is that if it had been placed in the *kli sharet* it takes on the status of *avodat kli* and he can no longer use his hand. This support this understanding that the methods are not just two different techniques in offering the *mincha*, but two different *dinei hakravah* – laws or models in who they are offered.

The *Griz* refines this understanding further. The *Tosfeta* explains that *R' Shimon* maintains his position also with the *menachot* that are fully burnt (*menachot nisrafot*). One might ask that if this law is in the *kometz* that once it is in the *kli*, it takes on the law that it must be offered with the *kli*, then in the *menachot nisrafot*, that are in a *kli* how could it then be offered by hand? He explains that it is not a *din* in the *kometz* but rather in the *avodah*. In other words, once one begins with the *avodat kli* it must continues as such. Now since when the entire *mincha* offering is first placed in the *kli sharet* it is not an *avodah*, that *avodah* “track” has not yet been confirmed. That is why both methods can be used for the *menachot nisrafot*. It is only once *avodat kli* is performed, where the *kemitzah* is placed in the *kli*, that the *kohen* must continue performing the *avodah* in that way.

Yisrael Bankier

Revision Questions

מנחות ב' א' – ד' ב'

- Explain the debate regarding one who performs *kemitza* with the intention of offering the *levonah* outside its specified time. (ב' א')
- Which two other cases are debated in a similar manner? (ב' ב')
- Explain how a *korban todah* can cause *pigul* to *lachmei todah*, but *lachmei todah* cannot cause *pigul* to a *korban todah*. (ב' ג')
- What two other cases share a similar ruling? (ב' ג'–ד')
- Explain the debate regarding one who had *machshevet pigul* when burning the *kometz* but not when burning the *levonah*. (ב' ה')
- What other case is debated in a similar manner? (ב' ה')
- What is the law if when slaughtering one of the *kivsei atzeret*, a person had *machshevet pigul* regarding the other? (ב' ה')
- Explain the debate regarding one that performs *kemitza* with the intent to eat it the next day. (א' א')
- What is the minimum size that one has in mind with *machshevet pigul* in order to make the *mincha* offering *pigul*? (א' ג')
- What is the law if one forgets to mix the flour of the *mincha* offering with its oil? (ג' ב')
- What is the law if one forgets to add salt to the *mincha* offering? (ג' ב')
- What is the law if the *kometz* from different *mincha* offerings gets mixed together? (ג' ב')
- With respect to which three *mincha* offerings does *R' Yehuda* argue? (ג' ב')
- What is the law if two *mincha* offerings that had not had *kemitza* performed to them, got mixed together? (ג' ג')
- What is the law regarding a *kometz* that became *tameh* and was nonetheless offered on the *mizbeach*? (ג' ג')
- What if the *kometz* was taken outside the *Beit Ha'Mikdash*? (ג' ג')
- Explain the debate regarding a *mincha* offering whose *shirayim* became *tameh* before the *kometz* was offered. (ג' ד')
- Explain the debate regarding a *mincha* offering whose *kometz* was not first placed in *kli sharet* prior to its offering. (ג' ד')
- Can the *kometz* be offered bit-by-bit? (ג' ד')
- Regarding what four things: מעוטו מעכב את רובו (ה' ה')
- In connection to *mincha* offerings, regarding what two pairs: זה מעכבים זה את זה (ה' ה')
- What other seven pairs: מעכבים זה את זה (ה' ה')
- Can one have *tefillin* missing a *parasha*? (ה' ז')
- Explain the debate regarding a *tallit* with *tzitzit* on only three corners. (ז' ז')
- Can one put on a *tefillin shel rosh* if he cannot put on a *tefillin shel yad*? (ז' א')
- Explain the debate regarding how the sacrifices of *Shavuot* should be brought if they were short of funds. (ז' ב')

Shiurim

ONLINE SHIURIM

Yisrael Bankier
mishnahyomit.com/shiurim

Rabbi Reuven Spolter
mishnah.co

Rabbi Chaim Brown
www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

Rabbi E. Kornfeld
Rabbi C. Brown
<http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calendars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm>

APPS

Mishnah Yomit
mishnahyomit.com

All Mishnah
Orthodox Union

Mishna Yomi
Our Somayach, South Africa

Kehati

SHIUR ON KOL HALOSHON

Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss
In US dial: 718 906 6400
Then select: 1 – 2 – 4

Next Week's Mishnayot...

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
14 September כ"א אלול	15 September כ"ב אלול	16 September כ"ג אלול	17 September כ"ד אלול	18 September כ"ה אלול	19 September כ"ו אלול	20 September כ"ז אלול
Menachot 4:3-4	Menachot 4:5-5:1	Menachot 5:2-3	Menachot 5:4-5	Menachot 5:6-7	Menachot 5:8-9	Menachot 6:1-2

