



Bal Tigra and Bal Tosif

The *Mishnah* (8:10) records the debate regarding cups of blood from two *korbanot* that got mixed up. The blood from both these *korbanot* are meant to be thrown on the bottom half of the *mizbeach*, however one requires it on one location, while the other required to be thrown on two corners. The *Mishnah* refers to this as “four” placements, because the blood thrown in this fashion reaches the four sides of the *mizbeach*.

R' Eliezer argues that the blood should be thrown twice for both bloods, while *R' Yehoshua* maintains that the blood can only be thrown once for each. The *Bartenura* explains that even though, according to *R' Eliezer's* solution, some of the blood will be thrown unnecessarily, he simply views that blood as being like water. *R' Yehoshua* however wishes to avoid violating the prohibition of adding to *mitzvah* – *bal tosif*. Furthermore, as long as the blood reaches the bottom half of the *mizbeach* at least once, the *korban* is valid. That is true even for a *korban* that ideally requires the additional placements of blood.

The *Mishnah* however records the debate between the two as follows. *R' Eliezer* argues that *R' Yehoshua's* solution is a violation of *bal tigra* – deducting from *mitzvot* – while *R' Yehoshua* counters that *R' Eliezer's* solution violates *bal tosif*. In the end, both argue that the prohibition is not violated in this case where there is a mixture.¹ Yet *R' Yehoshua* adds that being passive and not actively coming up against *bal tosif* is preferable.

The *Tosfot Yom Tov* explains that, as noted above, according to *R' Eliezer* there is no issue of *bal tosif*. The discussion in

the *Mishnah* is only working with *R' Yehoshua's* position that *bal tosif* is a consideration.

Recall that the *Bartenura* explained that *R' Yehoshua* further argues that an additional justification for performing only one placement is because it is sufficient, *bedi'eved*, for both *korbanot*. The *Keren Orah* (*Eiruvim* 100a) discusses why this rationale is important. He first cites the *Maharsha* who explains that if it both placements were necessary, *R' Yehoshua* would agree that “four” placements must be performed. The *Keren Orah* however argues that if the four were critical, then it would seem that *R' Yehoshua* would argue that there is no solution and neither cup could be used. The *Keren Orah* argues that the *Maharasha's* solution in the *R' Yehoshua's* eyes would still be *bal tosif*.²

The *Ohr Sameach* (*Pesulei Mukdashim* 2:11) cites the *Turi Even*. He first confirms that if one refrained from engaging in a *mitzvah*, he would not violate *bal tigra*. That being the case, no blood should be able to be thrown on the *mizbeach* to avoid *bal tosif* and *bal tigra*. By doing one placement, one is actively causing the prohibition of *bal tigra* to be violated.

The *Ohr Sameach* however dismisses the question. He explains that in that case, *bal tigra* would not be actively violated when doing the first placement. When the *korban* was slaughtered, he was obligated to perform (at least) that first placement. *Bal tigra* is only an issue when refraining from performing the addition placement, which is occurring passively.⁴

Yisrael Bankier

¹ The *Ritva* (*Rosh Hashana* 28b) explains that *bal tosif* is only an issue when facing the *mitzvah* alone and adding to the performance of that *mitzvah*. In this case, the additional placement that are being performed to the wrong blood, is not for the fulfillment of that *korban*, but rather to ensure sufficient blood was placed on the *mizbeach* for the blood that required it.

² Perhaps the *Maharasha's* position is based on the simple understanding of the *Mishnah* that *bal tosif* is not an issue when we have a mixture – see the previous footnote. The *Keren Orah* in the end suggests that at least one placement should be able to be performed unless the single placement would be considered incomplete and invalid for a *korban* that required more.

³ The *Ohr Sameach* compares this with the case of one who is to perform a *brit millah* on *Shabbat* and the various *semamanim* necessary for after the *brit* spill, which would require *chilul Shabbat* to prepare replacements. We do not say that they should delay the *brit*. The *mitzvah* at hand is to perform the *brit* on *Shabbat*. After that, due to *pikuach nefesh* one can the prepare the *semamanim*.

Revision Questions

זבחים ח' – י' – י"ב

- What is the law regarding a mixture of blood to be sprinkled on the *mizbeach* and: (ח' י') blood from *korban* that had a blemish? (ח' י')
- What are the two opinions regarding a mixture of:
 - Cups of blood? (ח' י')
 - Blood to be sprinkled on the top half of the *mizbeach* with blood to be sprinkled on the bottom half? (י' ט')
 - Blood that requires one sprinkling with blood that requires “four”? (Explain the ensuing debate.) (ח' י')
- What is the law regarding a mixture of blood that was to be sprinkled on the outer alter with blood to be sprinkled on the inner alter? (ח' י"א)
- Regarding the previous question, what is the law if the *kohen* went ahead a sprinkled the blood first inside then outside? (ח' י"א)
- There is a debate regarding the previous question; regarding which sacrifice does everyone agree? (ח' י"א)
- If blood from a *Chatat* was collected in two bowls and one was taken outside the *Azarah*, what is the status of the inner one? (ח' י"ב)
- If one of the bowls was taken inside the *Heichal* – what is the status of the bowl in the *Azarah* according to:
 - *R' Yosi Ha'Glili* and *Chachamim*? (ח' י"ב)
- What type of *pesul* does the *Tzitz* effect acceptance for? (ח' י"ב)
- What is the difference between the opinions of *Rabban Gamliel* and *Rabbi Yehoshua* with regards to sacrifices that must come down from the *mizbeach*? (ט' א')
- What must be taken down from the *mizbeach*, according to *R' Shimon*, if a *zevach pasul* and *nechasim p'sulim* were offered? (ט' א')
- What type of sacrifices that are *p'sulim* must be taken down from the *mizbeach* according to *R' Yehuda*? (ט' ב')
- Name three types of *p'sulim* that would have occurred outside the *Mikdash*? (ט' ג')
- How did the father of *R' Channinah Segan Ha'Kohanim* act with regards to the offering of *korbanot* that were *ba'lei mumim*? (ט' ג')
- Name three parts of an animal, which, if they are removed, should not be brought up on the *mizbeach*? (ט' ד')
- If sacrificial parts came off the *mizbeach* before *chatzot*, is one *chayav meilah* for their inappropriate use? (ט' ד')
- What else (besides the *mizbeach*) consecrates that which is contained in/on it? (ט' ז')
- Can a vessel which is used to hold liquid measures, consecrate a dry measure? (ט' ז')
- In the following cases, which offering takes precedence, and why? (י' א')
 - *Tamid* and *Mussaf*?
 - *Mussaf* of *Rosh Chodesh* and *Mussaf* of *Shabbat*?
 - *Mussaf* of *Rosh Hashanah* and *Mussaf* of *Rosh Chodesh*?
- In the following cases, which offering takes precedence, and why? (י' ב')
 - The blood of a *chatat* and the blood of an *olah*?
 - The sacrificial parts of a *chatat* and those of an *olah*?
 - *Chatat* and *asham*?
 - *Todah* and *asham*?

Shiurim

ONLINE SHIURIM

Yisrael Bankier
mishnahyomit.com/shiurim

Rabbi Reuven Spolter
mishnah.co

Rabbi Chaim Brown
www.shemayisrael.com/mishnah/

Rabbi E. Kornfeld
Rabbi C. Brown
<http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calendars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm>

APPS

Mishnah Yomit
mishnahyomit.com

All Mishnah
 Orthodox Union

Mishna Yomi
 Our Somayach, South Africa

Kehati

SHIUR
ON KOL HALOSHON

Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss
 In US dial: 718 906 6400
 Then select: 1 – 2 – 4

Next Week's Mishnayot...

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
17 August כ"ג אב	18 August כ"ד אב	19 August כ"ה אב	20 August כ"ו אב	21 August כ"ז אב	22 August כ"ח אב	23 August כ"ט אב
Zevachim 10:3-4	Zevachim 10:5-6	Zevachim 10:7-8	Zevachim 11:1-2	Zevachim 11:3-4	Zevachim 11:5-6	Zevachim 11:7-8

