



Asham Talui and Yom Kippur

The *Mishnah* (6:3) discusses a difference of opinion regarding the *asham talui*. Recall that the *asham talui* is the *korban* that is brought when there is doubt regarding whether one violated a prohibition that obligates him to bring a *korban chatat*. The *Mishnah* teaches that *R' Eliezer* maintains that one could even bring that *korban* daily, voluntarily.

The *Gemara* (25a) explains, *R' Eliezer* reasons that the *asham talui* is a voluntary *korban*. If it was obligatory, he argues that even if it became clear that he did violate the prohibition, he should not be required to bring a *korban chatat* having already brought the *asham talui*. That however is not the case – he must still bring a *korban chatat*. The *Chachamim* however reason that it is indeed obligatory, like all other guilt and sin offerings. This *korban* however serves a different purpose. It does not achieve an atonement for the sin, but rather protects the person from any potential *yissurim* until it is clear whether he sinned or not.

The next *Mishnah* (6:4) teaches that if one was obligated to bring an *asham talui* and, after which, the day of *yom kippur* passed, the person would no longer be required to bring it. *R' Elazar* in the *Gemara* (25b) explains that it says in the *Torah* (16:30), “From all your sins before Hashem you will be purified”. The *Gemara* understands that it is only those sins that are known to *Hashem*, that *Yom Kippur* exempts. A sin offering, by contrast, one would have to bring after *yom kippur*.

At a first reading, this appears to make more sense according to the *Chachamim*'s understanding. The *korban* is obligatory. The *korban* protects the individual. *Yom Kippur* can achieve that by atoning for the sin so as to protect the person from the *yissurim*, such that the *asham talui* is no longer necessary. According to *R'*

Eliezer however the *asham talui* is considered a voluntary offering. *Yom Kippur* does not alleviate one from voluntary offerings. Would *R' Eliezer* also agree with the ruling in our *Mishnah*? The way the *Mishnah* is presented it appears that it is according to all opinions.

There is another way to understand what *Yom Kippur* achieves in the case of the *asham talui*. Thus far we have assumed that *Yom Kippur* achieves an atonement for the sin thereby making the *asham talui* unnecessary. The *Yalkut Biurim (Metivta)* however cites the *Griz* who explains instead, that *Yom Kippur* takes the place of the *korban*.

The *Griz* brings his proof from the *Gemara* that asks that a woman who has a doubt whether she is obligated to bring a *korban* for childbirth, should also be exempt after *yom kippur* from bringing that *korban*. *Rav Hoshaya* answers that the *seir ha'mishtaleach* atones for “all their sins” and not for matters of purity or impurity. The difficulty with the *Gemara* is what was the original assumption that it might work? The *korban* of a *yoledet* is to enable her to consume *korbanot* unlike an *asham* which is related to a sin. Rather it must be that *Yom Kippur* is considered like a *korban*. The *Gemara* then assumed that because it takes the place of a *korban*, it could also enable a *yoledet* to eat from *kodshim*. The conclusion is that *Yom Kippur* is considered like a *korban* for only those *korbanot* that relate to sins.

Based on this understanding, one could suggest that even according to *R' Eliezer*, after *Yom Kippur*, the *asham talui* need not be brought. Even though he views the *asham talui* as a voluntary *korban*, as *Yom Kippur* passes, it is considered as if that *korban*, which relates to a sin, has been offered.

Yisrael Bankier

Revision Questions

כריתות ה' ד' – ו' ט'

- What is the law regarding a piece of *kodesh* meat and a piece of regular meat where: (ה' ד: ט')
 - One person ate both?
 - Two people ate one each but it is not known which person ate the *kodesh* piece?
- What other case is brought that is similar to the previous question? (ה' ה: ט')
- What is the law regarding the previous question if one piece was *kodesh* and the other *cheilev*? (ה' ו: ט')
- What is the law if one piece was *cheilev* and the other *cheilev kodesh*? (ה' ו: ט')
- What is the law regarding a piece *cheilev* and a piece of *cheilev notar* where: (ה' ח: ט')
 - One person ate both one after the other?
 - Two people ate one each but it is not known which person ate the *cheilev notar*?
- What are the opinions regarding one that brings an *asham talui* and the matter was clarified that he did not sin: (ה' א: ט')
 - Before the *korban* was slaughtered?
 - After the *korban* was slaughtered?
- Regarding the previous question, what is the comparable ruling for: (ה' ב: ט')
 - An *asham vada'i*?
 - A *shor ha'niskal*?
 - An *eglah arufah*?
- According to who, can one bring an *asham talui* every day? (ה' ג: ט')
- Who acted according to this ruling and which days was the exception? (ה' ג: ט')
- Which sin-related offering does not need to be brought after *Yom Kippur*? (ה' ד: ט')
- What two laws are taught regarding a *chatat ha'ohf* that is brought in a case of doubt? (ה' ה: ט')
- What is the minimum value of an *asham* offering? (ה' ו: ט')
- What is the law regarding one that separated this sum of money then purchased two animals for the purpose of *asham* offerings? (ה' ו: ט')
- What if the two animals were purchased for regular purposes? (ה' ו: ט')
- Are sin-offerings “transferable”? (ה' ז: ט')
- What is the law regarding an animal separated for a sin-offering whose owner died? (ה' ז: ט')
- In what circumstance can money separated for the purpose of an animal offering, be used for a bird offering? (ה' ח: ט')
- What is one difference between these two types of offerings? (ה' ח: ט')
- Is the ordering of animals listed by *korbanot* indicative of preference? Which two examples are brought? (ה' ט: ט')
- Why is the honour of a father prior to a mother? (ה' ט: ט')
- What other case brought is similar to the one in the previous question? (ה' ט: ט')

Shiurim

ONLINE SHIURIM

Yisrael Bankier
mishnahyomit.com/shiurim

Rabbi Reuven Spolter
mishnah.co

Rabbi Chaim Brown
www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

Rabbi E. Kornfeld
Rabbi C. Brown
<http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calendar/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm>

APPS

Mishnah Yomit
mishnahyomit.com

All Mishnah
Orthodox Union

Mishna Yomi
Our Somayach, South Africa

Kehati

SHIUR ON KOL HALOSHON

Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss
In US dial: 718 906 6400
Then select: 1 – 2 – 4

Next Week's Mishnayot...

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
8 March י"ט אדר	9 March כ' אדר	10 March כ"א אדר	11 March כ"ב אדר	12 March כ"ג אדר	13 March כ"ד אדר	14 March כ"ה אדר
Meilah 1:1-2	Meilah 1:3-4	Meilah 2:1-2	Meilah 2:3-4	Meilah 2:5-6	Meilah 2:7-8	Meilah 2:9-3:1

