



A Doubtful Bird Sin Offering

Certain *korbanot* may be brought when there is a doubt whether the person is obligated to bring that *korban*, whilst other *korbanot* may not. Those that can be offered include *korbanot* where one can stipulate that if they are not required to bring that *korban*, then it should be considered a voluntary *korban*. For example, an *olah* or *shelamim*. One cannot make such a stipulation in the case of a *chatat* (sin offering) since they cannot be brought voluntarily. The *chatat* therefore it is not brought in the case of doubt. We however learn that if there is a doubt regarding a bird *chatat*, then it can be offered, even though it may not be consumed by the *kohanim*. We shall try to understand why.

Why can this *korban* be offered in a case of doubt, when one cannot make the above stipulation, whilst it also cannot be consumed by the *kohanim*? *Rashi* (7b, s.v. *ve'ein*) explains that the *korban* cannot be consumed, because for bird offerings it is *melika*, and not *shechita*, that is performed. The *kohen* kills the bird with his thumbnail from the back of its neck. If *melika* is performed on a regular bird, it is not considered slaughtered but rather a *neveilah*. What about the concern of potentially bringing *chulin* into the *azara*? He explains that since it is only the blood from the *chatat ha'ohf* that is placed on the *mizbeach* and not the meat, there is no problem even if it was not a *korban*. In other words, placing the blood on the *mizbeach* is not considered "consumption" of the *mizbeach* as it would be with other sacrificial parts. *Rashi* continues by citing the *Gemara* in *Nazir* (29a) that derives the ability to bring the *chatat* bird offering from the *pesukim*.

Note that there are two problems with *chulin* in the *azara*. *Shechita*, the slaughter, and *achila*, the consumption of

the *mizbeach*. The *Gemara* later (26b) discusses a case where the *melika* was performed in the case of a *safek* and it was later discovered that she did not need to bring the *korban*. The *Gemara* explains that one is not allowed to derive benefit from the *korban* (*issur hanaah*). This prohibition however is rabbinic. *Rashi* explains that on a biblical level it should be permitted. This is because it is *shechita* that is prohibited to be performed on a regular animal in the *azara*. Violating that would create the *issur hanaah*. In this case however, it was *melika* that was performed and not *shechita*.

The *Shita Mekubetzet* however argues that this appears to contradict the *Gemara* in *Nazir* (29a) that explains that there are two issues with performing *melika* and consuming the meat from a *safek chatat ha'ohf*. One is that if one was not obligated to offer the bird then the *melika* would make the bird a *neveilah*. The second is that it might be considered *chulin* that was slaughtered in the *azarah*. This second concern clearly contradicts the *Gemara* in *Keritut*. The *shita mekubetzet* suggest that perhaps that *Gemara* is according to the opinion that law of *chulin* that is slaughtered in the *azara* is not biblical.

The *Beit HaLevi* (*Shut* I 2:11) however explains that the *Gemaras* are addressing two separate concerns. The *Gemara* in *Keritut* is addressing the *issur hanaah* that is created for *chulin* that is slaughtered. Since in this case there was no *shechita* the *issur hanaah* was not created. The *Gemara* in *Nazir* however addresses the broader issue of performing an act, that resembles *avodah* with *chullin*. While *melika* in this case does not create an *issur hanaah*, it is an act that resembles *avoda* and is still prohibited. He cites the *Gemara* in *Menachot* that prohibits *tenufa* (waving) of *chulin* in the *azara* as proof.

Yisrael Bankier

Revision Questions

כריתות א': ב' – ג': ב'

- What must one do if they violated one of the prohibitions unintentionally? (א': ב')
- What must one do if they are unsure whether they violated one of these prohibitions? (א': ב')
- Explain the debate regarding the exception to rule discussed in the previous question. (א': ב')
- When would a *yoledet* bring a *korban chatat* and:
 - It be consumed? (א': ג')
 - It not be consumed? (א': ד')
- When would a *yoledet* not bring a *korban* at all? (א': ה')
- Explain the debate between *Beit Shammai* and *Beit Hillel* regarding a woman that miscarries on the eighty-first night after giving birth to a girl. (א': ו')
- What is the law regarding a woman that has experienced multiple births and it is doubtful in each case whether she must bring a *korban*? (א': ז')
- What did *Rabban Shimon ben Gamliel* do to fight the inflated price of birds? (א': ח')
- What are the four *mechusarei kapparah*? (א': ט')
- For which four prohibitions does one bring a *korban* whether it was transgressed *be'shogeg* or *be'meizid*? (א': י')
- For which five prohibitions does one bring one *korban* for multiple transgressions? (א': י"ג')
- For which five prohibitions does one bring a *korban oleh ve'ored*? (א': י"ד')
- What are the differences between a *shifcha charufah* and other prohibited relationships? (א': י"ז')
- What is a *shofcha charufah*? (א': י"ח')
- What is the law regarding forbidden relationships where: (א': י"ט')
 - One party was a *katan*?
 - One party acted *be'shogeg* and the other *be'meizid*?
- What is the law of one person said that one ate *cheilev* and another said he did not? (א': י"א')
- Explain the debate where two witnesses testified that a person ate *cheilev* and he denied it. (א': י"ב')
- In what way is transgressing multiple transgresses harsher than transgressing one multiple times? (א': י"ג')
- Regarding the previous question, in what way is it less harsh? (א': י"ד')

Shiurim

ONLINE SHIURIM

Yisrael Bankier
mishnahyomit.com/shiurim

Rabbi Reuven Spolter
mishnah.co

Rabbi Chaim Brown
www.shemayisrael.com/mishnah/

Rabbi E. Kornfeld
Rabbi C. Brown
<http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calendar/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm>

APPS

Mishnah Yomit
mishnahyomit.com

All Mishnah
Orthodox Union

Mishna Yomi
Our Somayach, South Africa

Kehati

SHIUR ON KOL HALOSHON

Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss
In US dial: 718 906 6400
Then select: 1 – 2 – 4

Next Week's Mishnayot...

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
22 February ה' אדר	23 February ו' אדר	24 February ז' אדר	25 February ח' אדר	26 February ט' אדר	27 February י' אדר	28 February י"א אדר
Keritot 3:3-4	Keritot 3:5-6	Keritot 3:7-8	Keritot 3:9-10	Keritot 4:1-2	Keritot 4:3-5:1	Keritot 5:2-3

