



Redeeming Menachot and Klei Sharet

The *Mishnah* (12:1) opens by explaining that if *menachot* or *nesachim* became *tameh* prior to being placed in the *klei sharet*, they can be redeemed. After that point however, they cannot.

The *Bartenura* explains that until the flour is placed in the *klei sharet*, even though it has been set aside for the purpose of a *mincha* offering, it only has *kedushat damim* and not *kedushat ha'guf*. In other words, it does not have intrinsic *kedusha* - *kedushat ha'guf* – until it is placed in the *klei sharet*. Prior to that point only its monetary value has been dedicated for the purpose of a *korban* – *kedushat damim* – and can therefore be redeemed.

It is important to note that the same is not true for an animal that is set aside for a *korban*; it immediately attains *kedushat ha'guf*. Why?

The *Chazon Yechezkel* (*Keritut* 4:6, *Biurim*) addresses this question at length, citing several answers. He first cites the *Ravaad* (*Tamid*) who explains that an animal is immediately ready to be offered; with *shechita* being the first *avodah*. Consequently, from dedication it can attain *kedushat ha'guf*. The flour for a *mincha* however first requires some effort, including that it be mixed with oil, before it is ready to be offered. That being the case it is not yet “ready” to attain *kedushat ha'guf*.

The *Chazon Yechezkel* however is not satisfied with this answer. That is because find that the law is same for other *mincha* offerings that are not offered with any oil or frankincense. These include the sin offering and *minchat sotah* which are immediately ready to be offered.¹

The *Zera Avraham* brings the answer of the *Ohr Sameach*. He explains that the necessity of placing the flour into the *kli sharet* is to combine all the flour into one *korban* – *tziruf*. The *mincha* requires a volume of an *issaron*, and *tziruf* for that volume is required.

The *Chazon Yechezkel* also finds this position difficult. He argues that a *klei sharet* is not necessary for *tziruf*. It can simply be achieved when a utensil that can measure the required volume.²

The *Chazon Yechezkel* finally suggests that we find with an animal, it is immediately ready for the *avodat hakrava* – it is ready for the first *avodah* of *shechita*. Consequently, immediately from its dedication it must have *kedushat ha'guf*. For the *mincha* offering, it must first be placed in a *kli sharet* before *kemitzah* can be performed. Since *avodah* cannot be performed prior to that, it does not attain *kedushat ha'guf* until placed in the *kli sharet*.

A similar approach can be found in the *Griz* (*Chidushim*, p 162). He explains that *kedushat ha'guf* can be attained in two ways. Through speech or when placed in the *kli sharet*. For animals, the *pasuk* teaches it is the first way, “... anything for which is given to *Hashem* shall be *Kodesh*” (*Vayikra* 29:9). The *pasuk* specifically refers to animal offering. For anything that is placed in a *kli sharet* however, the *pasuk* states, “anything that touches them shall be *kadosh*.” (*Shemot* 30:29) For *minchat* offerings, it is therefore only once it touches the *klei sharet* that it become *kadosh*.

Yisrael Bankier

¹ The *Chazon Yechezkel* uses this fact to explain why the *Tosefta* explains that for the *minchat chotah*, if it has not yet been sanctified in the *kli sharet* then it can be redeemed “like all other *menachot*”. The need to stress that the law also applies to the *minchat chotah* is because one might have thought that the *minchat chotah*, that is immediately ready to be offered, would be treated differently. He explains that the similar language that is used to teach the same law for the *minchat sotah* (*Sotah* 22b) is also for this reason.

Another difficulty can be found in the *Griz* who notes that *levona* that is brought on its own, does not require an action to be performed in the *kli sharet*, yet also still shares the same law.

² One could attempt to answer this question based on the *Griz* we learnt two issues ago. Recall that for *mincha* offerings, there was a requirement of *medida* (measuring) within a *kli sharet*. (What was debated between the *Chachamim* and *R' Shimon* was whether there was a *din* of *medida* for dividing the *minchat chavitin*.) That being the case, perhaps that *tziruf* to give the flour the status of a *korban mincha* is only attained once the *din* of *medidah* has been satisfied.

Revision Questions

מנחות י"א: ז' – י"ג: ו'

- What were the two tables in the entrance hall to the *kodesh* used for and what was the difference between them? (י"א: ז')
- Describe how the *lechem ha'panim* was changed? (י"א: ז')
- How was the *lechem ha'panim* distributed if *Yom Kippur* fell on *Shabbat*? (י"א: ז')
- What is the law if the *lechem ha'panim* and *bazichin* were placed on the *Shulchan* on *Shabbat* but the *bazichin* were only burnt after *Shabbat*? (י"א: ח')
- What should be done if the *lechem ha'panim* and *bazichin* were placed on the *Shulchan* after *Shabbat*? (י"א: ח')
- Explain how the *shtei halechem* would have been eaten two and three days after baking? (י"א: ט')
- Explain how the *lechem ha'panim* would have been eaten nine, ten and eleven days after baking? (י"א: ט')
- From what point onward, can *menachot* that became *tameh* no longer be redeemed? (י"ב: א')
- Regarding which four sanctified items does redemption not apply? (י"ב: א')
- If someone articulated that he wished to bring a *mincha machavat* and brought instead a *mincha marcheset* when is that offering valid and when is it invalid? (י"ב: ב')
- What other case is brought similar to the one in the previous question? (י"ב: ב')
- What is the law if one volunteered to bring a *mincha* offering made of barley? (י"ב: ג')
- What is the law if one volunteered to bring a *mincha* offering from one and half *esronim* of fine flour? (י"ב: ג')
- Who argues with the previous two laws? (י"ב: ג')
- What is the maximum size of a *mincha* offering that can be brought in one utensil? (י"ב: ד')
- What are the two reasons giving for this limit? (י"ב: ד')
- What volumes of wine is one not able to volunteer as *nesachim*? (י"ב: ד')
- Explain the debate regarding whether one can volunteer oil. (י"ב: ה')
- What restriction to the volunteering of a *mincha* offering does not apply to any other offerings? (י"ב: ה')
- What is the law regarding one that volunteered to bring a *mincha* offering but:
 - Does not remember the size he specified?
 - Did not specify which type? (Provide both opinions.) (י"ג: א')
 - Does not remember which type specified? (י"ג: ב')
- What is the law regarding one that volunteered to bring "menachot"? (י"ג: ב')
- What is the minimum that one must bring if he volunteers to bring:
 - Wood? Frankincense? (י"ג: ג')
 - Gold? Silver? Copper? (י"ג: ד')
 - Wine? Oil? (י"ג: ה')
- What are the "five *kematzim*"? (י"ג: ג')
- What is the law if one volunteered to bring a specific amount of gold but did not remember the amount? (י"ג: ד')
- What other case shares the same law? (י"ג: ה')
- What must one bring if they volunteered to bring a *korban olah*? (י"ג: ו')
- Regarding the previous question, what must he bring if he specified the type, but forgot? (י"ג: ו')

Shiurim

ONLINE SHIURIM

Yisrael Bankier
mishnahyomit.com/shiurim

Rabbi Reuven Spolter
mishnah.co

Rabbi Chaim Brown
www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

Rabbi E. Kornfeld
Rabbi C. Brown
<http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calendars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm>

APPS

Mishnah Yomit
mishnahyomit.com

All Mishnah
Orthodox Union

Mishna Yomi
Our Somayach, South Africa

Kehati

SHIUR ON KOL HALOSHON

Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss
In US dial: 718 906 6400
Then select: 1 – 2 – 4

Next Week's Mishnayot...

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
19 October כ"ז תשרי	20 October כ"ח תשרי	21 October כ"ט תשרי	22 October ל' תשרי	23 October א' חשוון	24 October ב' חשוון	25 October ג' חשוון
Menachot 13:7-8	Menachot 13:9-10	Menachot 13:11 - Chulin 1:1	Chulin 1:2-3	Chulin 1:4-5	Chulin 1:6-7	Chulin 2:1-2

