Volume 21 Issue 22



# Nolad

How can one undo a *neder*? The *Mishnah* explains that a person must go to a *Chacham* who can *matir* the *neder* based on a *petach*. In other words, the *Chacham* needs to find some detail, that had it been considered at the time of the *neder*, it would have stopped the person from making the *neder*. On that basis, the *neder* may be undone.

The *Mishnah* (9:2) however records a debate regarding whether *nolad* can be a basis for a *petach*. This refers to a consideration that only arose after the time of the *neder*. Had the person known that the circumstance would have changed, he would have never made the *neder*. One example is if one made a *neder* against deriving any benefit from an individual. That person then trained as a *sofer* and the person that made the *neder* now requires his services. R' *Eliezer* maintains that that even such cases can form the basis of a *petach* whereas the *Chachamim* disagree.

The *Rosh* explains that the reason the *Chachamim* disagree is because when one is *matir* a *neder* it is based on a regret, which uproots the *neder* from its beginning. It can do so because the regret defines the *neder* as a mistaken *neder*. Considering that it goes back to that point in time when the *neder* was made, *nolad*, this unlikely development, would not have been a consideration that would have stopped him from making the *neder*. Consequently it cannot act as a *petach*.

The *Rambam* (*Shevuot* 6:12) however explains the issue of *nolad* differently. He explains that in the case of *nolad*, the person does not regret making the *neder*. The person would be very happy for the *neder* to continue and the subject of the *neder* not having become a *sofer*. In other words, a *matir* must be based on regretting the *neder*. In this case the person is upset about the development and not the *neder*. The *Rambam* however adds that if he regretted the *neder* itself (without the probing of a *Chacham*) as a result of the development then we would be able to *matir* the *neder*.

The Kesef Mishnah explain that the last statement of the Rambam was motivated by the Gemara in Ketubat (63a). There the Gemara explains that the Kalba Savua made a neder forbidding R'Akiva from deriving any benefit from him, after R'Akiva married his daughter. At the time R'Akiva was a simple shepherd. After R'Akiva returned having become the giant of the generation, R'Akiva asked Kalba Savua whether he would have made the neder had he know who R'Akiva would become. Based on his confirming that he would have never made the neder, R'Akiva was matir the neder. The difficulty with this Gemara is that it appears to be a classic case of nolad, upon which one cannot matir a neder.

The *Kesef Mishnah* explains that the *Rambam*'s distinction above answers this question. In this case, the development made *Kalba Savua* regret the *neder* itself. He did not regret the development that *R' Akiva* became a great sage. Quite the opposite. *Kalba Savua* would have been very happy for his son-in-law to became this great person and would preferred to give to him.

The *Ritva* however brings two different answers. The first is that *Kalba Savua* had responded that even if *R' Akiva* knew one *perek* or one *halacha* he never would have made the *neder*. At the time of the *neder R' Akiva* already knew that minimal amount, so the *heter* was not relying on *nolad*. The second answer is that *Rachel* was only willing to marry *R' Akiva* on condition that he would become a *talmid chacham*. Had *Kalba Savua* knew that that was the sincere condition he never would have made the *neder*.

The *Tosfot* however explain that this case is not *nolad* because he was committed to going to learn *Torah* and someone who goes will become great in *Torah*. Since the results was certain at the time of the *neder* it is not defined as *nolad*.

Yisrael Bankier

# **Revision Questions**

#### נדרים זי :חי – טי :הי

What is the difference between the following two *nedarim*: (יו: חי) "שאת עושה איני אוכל עד הפסחי"

• What is the law regarding the following *neder* after *pesach*: (ז׳:ט׳) (ז׳:ט׳) שאת נהנית לי עד הפסח אם תלכי לבית אביך עד החגיי

• When does a *neder* end if it is made for: (ת׳:א׳)

- $\circ$  A day?
- This day?
- A week?
- This week?
- A month?
- This month?
- With what wording of a *neder* is the end of the *neder* the beginning of *Pesach*? Is the end of *Pesach*? (יו: בי)
- When does a *neder* end if it is made to apply until the summer? (*n*: :*c*)
- Complete the following principle: (ח׳: ג׳)
- ייכל \_\_\_\_\_ ואמר עד שיגיע אסור עד שיגיע אמר עד שיהא אסור עד שיצא

יכל\_\_\_\_\_בין אמר עד שיהא בין אמר עד שיגיע אינו אסור אל עד\_\_\_\_\_

- What is the indication
  - that summer has began?
  - that summer has ended?
  - o of the beginning of the harvest season? ( $(\pi': \pi')$
  - o of the beginning of the rainy season? ((n):(n))
- When is the end of the rainy season? (חי:הי)
- If one made a *neder* till the end of *Adar* without knowing that the year was a leap year, when does the *neder* end? (*n*: :*n*)
- When does a *neder* against eating meat end if it was made until the fast of *Yom Kippur*? (ח׳ : ר׳)
- Give an example where a person can effectively undo a *neder* affecting them, that was made by someone else. ('i: 'n)
- What does *R*' *Eliezer* argue can be used to undo a *neder* and in what case do the *Chachamim* agree? (טי:אי)
- Can circumstances that occur after a *neder* is made be used as considerations to undo a *neder*? (Provide some examples that were given in the *Mishnah*) (v::cv)
- Provide an example of a case where *R' Meir* maintains it is like *nolad* but does not share the same law as *nolad*. (*ν*: :*ν*)
- According to who can *p*'sukim be used as considerations when undoing a *neder*? List some of those *p*'sukim. (*v*:*v*)
- Which *Tana* used financial obligations in a *ketubah* as basis for undoing a *neder*? (טי:הי)

## Shiurim

### **ONLINE SHIURIM**

*Yisrael Bankier* mishnahyomit.com/shiurim

> Rabbi Reuven Spolter mishnah.co

Rabbi Chaim Brown www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

Rabbi E. Kornfeld Rabbi C. Brown http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calend ars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm

### APPS

Mishnah Yomit mishnahyomit.com

All Mishnah Orthodox Union

*Mishna Yomi* Our Somayach, South Africa

Kehati

#### SHIUR ON KOL HALOSHON

Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss In US dial: 718 906 6400 Then select: 1 - 2 - 4

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
24 March	25 March	26 March	27 March	28 March	29 March	30 March
י״ד אדר	טייו אדר	ט״ז אדר	י״ז אדר	י״ח אדר	יייט אדר	כ׳ אדר
Nedarim 9:6-	Nedarim 9:8-	Nedarim 9:10-	Nedarim 10:2-	Nedarim 10:4-	Nedarim 10:6-	Nedarim 10:8-
7	9	10:1	3	5	7	11:1

## Next Week's Mishnayot...