



Agged Kli

The *Mishnah* (10:2) discusses a case where one took a basket full of vegetables from the house and placed it on the border of the house and the doorstep. The step is sufficiently low such that it is considered part of the public domain. The *Mishnah* teaches that even if a majority of the basket is outside the house, one has not violated the prohibition of *hotzaah* (taking an object from the private to public domain). It is only once the entire basket is taken outside, has one violated the prohibition.

The *Gemara* (*Shabbat* 91a) records a debate regarding our *Mishnah*. *Chizkiya* maintains that the *Mishnah* is referring to a case where contents are cucumbers or pumpkins that are placed in a way that no vegetable has fully left the house until the entire basket has been removed. If however the basket contained mustard seeds, then one would be liable. *Rashi* explains that that is because some of the seeds have been transferred from the private to public domain. This is how the *Bartenura* explains that *Mishnah*.

R' Yochanan however disagrees and one would be exempt even if the basket contained mustard seed. The *Gemara* explains that the debate is based on whether *agged cli*, the fact that the basket contains mustard seeds, is considered *agged*. The *Rambam* rules like *R' Yochanan* and we shall try to understand this position.

The *Tosfot* (*Pesachim* 85b, s.v. *benigrarim*) explains that if one were to pull back those items that are still inside, when drawing the basket it would also bring those seeds that are outside along with it. Why that fact makes one is exempt still requires some thought.

The *Rambam* (*Shabbat* 12:11) however explains that since all the items are placed in one *kli* the contents are considered as if they are one object. Consequently, the fact that some

seeds are not outside is irrelevant since we view all the seeds as one mass.

Perhaps to understand the difference between the *Tosfot's* explanation and the *Rambam's*, we need to understand another ruling of the *Rambam*.

Interestingly the *Rambam* (*Shabbat* 13:14) discusses a similar case where one throws an item outside that is tied to a string, yet still holds onto that string. There he explains that if he could pull the item back, then he would be exempt. He explains that it is not considered as if the item had a complete *hanacha*. The explanation in this case appears to be like the *Tosfot*.

The *Chazon Yechezkel* (*Shabbat* 2a, s.v. *ve'im*) explains that according to *Rambam* the two cases are different. Recall, that the full *melacha* of *hotzaah* involves both *akira* (lifting it from one domain) and *hanacha* (placing it in the other). In our case where the vegetables are contained in a *kli*, the *Rambam* writes that if one takes some of it out he is exempt "until he takes out the entire basket". The *Chazon Yechezkel* understands that according to the *Rambam*, since the contents are considered one mass, even *akira* has not even been performed.

With respect to the object on the string, the *Rambam* writes that "if he can draw the object towards him, he is exempt, since there is no *hanacha* – it is considered like he picked up the object but did not put it down [in the other domain]." The *Chazon Yechezkel* understands that in that case it is considered as if *akira* was indeed performed but not *hanacha*. To be clear, the fact that he is holding the string is not considered comparable to where part of the basket is inside. The entire object is indeed outside. Yet since he could pull it back, in the case, the action lacks *hanacha*.¹

Yisrael Bankier

¹ See the *Chazon Yechezkel* who then uses this understanding to present a difficulty with the first *Mishnah*.

Revision Questions

שבת ח' די – י' ג'

- What is the minimum measurement for:
 - Wax? (ח' די)
 - Reed? (ח' ה')
 - Bone?
 - Glass? (ח' ר')
- Which opinion is the most strict regarding the minimum measurement for pottery? (ח' ז')
- *Tumat niddah* is transferred through carrying (*masah*) – which other form of *tum'ah* can be transferred in such a manner? (ט' א')
- What *pasuk* is the law in the previous question learnt from? (ט' א')
- Can a boat become *tameh*? (ט' ב')
- From where do we learn that one may wash a child on the third day after the *brit millah*, even if it is *Shabbat*? (ג' ט')
- From where do we learn that a red thread is tied to the *se'ir ha'mishtaleach* on *Yom Kippur*? (ג' ט')
- To what is the act of anointing on *Yom Kippur* compared? (ד' ט')
- What is the minimum measure that one is liable for carrying, when carrying:
 - Wood?
 - Spices? (ט' ה')
 - Pepper?
 - Worn-out books? (ט' ט')
- Explain the debate regarding how many *chata'ot* one must bring if they carried a sampler box contain many different spices? (ט' ט')
- What is the minimum measure that one is liable for carrying when carrying pumpkin seeds? (ט' ט')
- Explain the debate regarding the minimum measure of a dead non-kosher grass-hopper. (ט' ט')
- Read the first *Mishnah* in the tenth *perek* – in which previous *Mishnah* was this principle learnt? (א' י')
- If someone took an object from their house and placed it on the threshold, then later took it from the threshold and placed it in the public domain, would they be obligated to bring a *chatat*? (ב' י')
- In which of the following manners of carrying would one be *chayav* for carrying on *Shabbat*? (ג' י')
 - In his mouth?
 - In his left hand?
 - On his shoulder?
 - On the back of his hand?

Shiurim

ONLINE SHIURIM

Yisrael Bankier
mishnahyomit.com/shiurim

Rabbi Reuven Spolter
mishnah.co

Rabbi Chaim Brown
www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

Rabbi E. Kornfeld
Rabbi C. Brown
<http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calendars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm>

APPS

Mishnah Yomit
mishnahyomit.com

All Mishnah
Orthodox Union

Mishna Yomi
Our Somayach, South Africa

Kehati

SHIUR ON KOL HALOSHON

Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss
In US dial: 718 906 6400
Then select: 1 – 2 – 4

Next Week's Mishnayot...

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
18 December כ"ד כסלו	19 December כ"ה כסלו	20 December כ"ו כסלו	21 December כ"ז כסלו	22 December כ"ח כסלו	23 December כ"ט כסלו	24 December ל' כסלו
Shabbat 10:4-5	Shabbat 10:6-11:1	Shabbat 11:2-3	Shabbat 11:4-5	Shabbat 11:6-12:1	Shabbat 12:2-3	Shabbat 12:4-5

