



## Purim HaMeshulash

*Masechet Purim* opens by explaining how *Purim* is observed on different days in different locations. Normally, *Purim* is on the fourteenth of *Adar*. In cities that were walled in the time of *Yehoshua*, *Purim* is on the fifteenth. We also learnt that for villages, they would sometimes read earlier, on the “*yom haknisa*”.<sup>1</sup> The second *Mishnah* however mentions that if the fifteenth coincided with *Shabbat*, both walled and regular cities would read the *megillah* on the fourteenth.

The *Bartenura* explains that the *megillah* would not be read on *Shabbat* out of concern that one might carry it in the public domain thereby desecrating *Shabbat*. The *megillah* is not read on the Sunday, because since the *megillah* say “*lo yaavor*”, the *Chachamim* understand that it cannot be read after the fifteenth. Consequently, it was read the day before on the fourteenth.

What about the other *mitzvot*? The *Bartenura* explains that the special *Torah* reading of *Purim* would still be read on the fifteenth (in these walled cities). Similarly, the laws of *Purim* are also meant to be studied on that day. The *Purim seudah* (meal) however is the subject of debate. Some say that it should occur on the fourteenth, the same day that the *megillah* is read. The *Bartenura* however cites the *Yerushalmi* that explains it is pushed off to Sunday – and this is how the *Shulchan Aruch* rules (688:6). Everyone however agrees that it is not observed on *Shabbat*. The *Yerushalmi* explains that since it says, “and you shall make them days of a festive meal and celebration” it must be a meal “as established by *Beit Din* and not one that is dependant on *Shamayim*”. *R’ Chaim* explains that it must be recognisable that the meal is commemorating the miracle which would not be so on *Shabbat*. Considering that in such a year, the *mitzvot* of *Purim* for the residents of a walled city is spread across three days, it is referred to as a *Purim HaMeshulash*.

There are however even more *mitzvot*. The *mitzvah* of *matanot la'evyonim* is connected to when they read the *megillah*, which would be read on the Friday. The *Gemara* explains that this is because the poor people anticipate these gifts when the *megillah* is read. *Mishloach manot* however is the subject of debate. The *Mishnah Berurah* (688:17)

explains that if the *seudah* is on Sunday, it follows that *mishloach manot* are also given on that day, since their purpose is for the *seudah*. He however cites that the *Maharal Chaviv* who argues that the *Bavli* maintains that *mishloach manot* are given on *Shabbat* since the *seudah* is also on *Shabbat*. The *Chazon Ish* (OC 154:1) cites *Rashi* who explains that *matanot laevyonim* cannot be given on *Shabbat* out of concerns that it would violate the prohibition of carrying. *Chazon Ish* reasons that the same can be said for *mishloach manot* also. He however understands that *mishloach manot* goes together, and is considered part of, *matanot laevyonim*. Consequently, the *Chazon Ish* reasons that they should be given on Friday, the day the *megillah* is read. He cites the *Kneset HaGadol* who also takes this position.

Interestingly the *Pri Chadash* was concerned from the opinion of the *Maharal Chaviv* and observed the *seudat Purim* on both *Shabbat* and Sunday. As a result, he would also ensure *mishloach manot* was given on both days (since he maintains the *mitzvah* is connected to the *seudah*). *Rav Soloveitch* (*Harerei Kedem* 207) however explains that there are two ways to understand the position of the *Yerushalmi*. Either it is a *din* in the *seudat purim* that it cannot be done on a day where the *simcha* is *bidei shamayim*. Alternatively, is a *din* in *Shabbat* itself that one cannot mix in an additional *simcha*. *Rav Soloveitchik* understands that the second understanding is correct, considering that the *Yerushalmi* also rules, for the same reason, one does not make a *Rosh Chodesh seudah* on *Shabbat*. He therefore argues that the *Pri Chadash*'s solution is not sufficient since the extra *seudah* would conflict with a law in *Shabbat* itself. That being the case, one also would not be able to be *machmir* and give *mishloach manot* on *Shabbat* either. That is because *mishloach manot* is connected to the *seudah* and it would be prohibited to have the *seudah* on *Shabbat*. *Rav Soloveitchik* suggests another reason. One would not be able to give *mishloach manot* on *Shabbat* due to the concern that one might carry them in the public domain. That being the case, since *mishloach manot* is a *kiyum* in the *mitzvah* of *seudah*, and it cannot be performed, the *seudah* itself also cannot<sup>2</sup>.

*Yisrael Bankier*

<sup>1</sup> We have discussed this exceptional practice, of different places observing *Purim* at different times, in the past. See volume 8 issue 15.

<sup>2</sup> He cites the *Meiri* that brings this explanation.

**Revision Questions**

תענית ד': א' – ח'

- Which are the three times when the *kohanim* do *birkat kohanim* four times during the day? (ד': א')
- Why do we have the *ma'amadot*? (ד': ב')
- What would the *Anshei ma'amad* do? (ד': ב')
- What days of the week would the *Anshei ma'amad* fast? (ד': ג')
- When would there be no *ma'amad*: (ד': ד')
  - *Shacharit*?
  - *Ne'illah*?
  - *Mincha*?
- How many dates were fixed for the *korban eitzim*? (ד': ה')
- What were the five things that occurred on the seventeenth of *Tamuz*? (ד': ו')
- What were the five things that occurred on the ninth of *Av*? (ד': ו')
- What two things are prohibited the week of *Tisha B'Av*? (ד': ז')
- What is one prohibited from eating on the day before *Tisha B'Av*? (ד': ז')
- On which two dates had events occurred that were the greatest for *Am Yisrael*? (What occurred on these dates?) (ד': ח')
- Explain what occurred on *Tu B'Av*? (ד': ח')

מגילה א': א' – ו'

- On which dates during *Adar* is it possible for the *megillah* to be read? (א': א')
- Explain how it is possible for the *megillah* to be read on different days? (א': ב')
- What is the definition of a “big city” and why is this important? (א': ג')
- Which four events are delayed if they coincide with *Shabbat*? (א': ג')
- What is different about a day on which the *megillah* is read early and *Purim*? (א': ג')
- What is the law if they read the *megillah* during *Adar* and then the year was turned into a leap year – do they read the *megillah* again in *Adar Sheni*? (א': ד')
- What is the difference between:
  - *Adar Rishon* and *Adar Sheni*? (א': ד')
  - *Shabbat* and *Yom Tov* with respect to the prohibition of performing *melacha*? (א': ה')
  - *Shabbat* and *Yom Kippur* with respect to the prohibition of performing *melacha*? (א': ה')
- A person that vows against gaining any benefit from his friend and a person that vows against gaining any food-related benefit from his friend? (א': ו')
- A *neder* and *nedava*? (א': ו')

**Shiurim**

**ONLINE SHIURIM**

*Yisrael Bankier*  
mishnahyomit.com/shiurim

*Rabbi Reuven Spolter*  
mishnah.co

*Rabbi Chaim Brown*  
www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

*Rabbi E. Kornfeld*  
*Rabbi C. Brown*  
http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calendars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm

**APPS**

*Mishnah Yomit*  
mishnahyomit.com

*All Mishnah*  
Orthodox Union

*Mishna Yomi*  
Our Somayach, South Africa

*Kehati*

**SHIUR  
ON KOL HALOSHON**

*Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss*  
In US dial: 718 906 6400  
Then select: 1 – 2 – 4

**Next Week's Mishnayot...**

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
17 September ב' תשרי	18 September ג' תשרי	19 September ד' תשרי	20 September ה' תשרי	21 September ו' תשרי	22 September ז' תשרי	23 September ח' תשרי
Megilah 1:7-8	Megilah 1:9-10	Megilah 1:11-12:1	Megilah 2:2-3	Megilah 2:4-5	Megilah 2:6-3:1	Megilah 3:2-3

