Volume 20 Issue 42



Rosh Hashanah on Shabbat

The *Mishnah* (4:1) teaches that if *Rosh Hashanah* coincided with *Shabbat*, then they would only blow the *shofar* in the "*mikdash*", but not elsewhere. We shall try to understand this *Mishnah*.

The *Bartenura* explains that blowing the *shofar* is not a *melacha*. Nonetheless the *Chachamim* forbade it out of concern that one might end up carrying it in the public domain, thereby desecrating *Shabbat*. In the *Beit HaMikdash* however, such rabbinic prohibitions (*shevutim*) do not apply. This explanation is consistent with *Rashi*'s understanding that the *Mishnah* is understood simply, and it was only in the *Beit HaMikdash* that the *shofar* was blow on *Shabbat*.

Interestingly, the *Rambam* however maintains that not only in the *Beit HaMikdash* was it permitted, but also throughout *Yerushalaim*. The *Tifferet Yisrael (Yachin 2)* explains that even in *Yerushalim* it is only permitted at the time the *Sanhedrin* was seated – until midday. In other words, it was only when the fear of the *Beit HaMikdash* and *Sanhedrin* were present that the *gezeira* would not apply. Importantly, according to this understanding, it is the content that allays the concerns underpinning the *gezeira*, rather than a general rule that *shevutim* do not apply in the *Beit HaMikdash*.

The *Tifferet Yisrael* continues (*Boaz* 2) that we find this logic that a *gezeira* does not apply when there is fear present that will alleviate the concern, in other contexts also. For example, we learnt that one is not allowed to read by the light of an oil lamp, out of concern that they might tip it, thereby increasing the fuel to the wick. Doing so would increase the flame and violate the prohibition against kindling on *Shabbat*. However, if students are learning by their teacher or one is reading by the lamp on *Yom Kippur*, one is allowed due to the additional fear in that context.

The *Tifferet Yisrael* continues by addressing another question. Why only find this *gezeira* applies to the *mitzvah*

of *Shofar*. Even for the *mitzvah* of *lulav*, the comparable *gezeira* was only after the time of the *Beit HaMikdash*. When it was standing however, the *lulav* was taken everywhere on the first day even if it coincided with *Shabbat*.

The Tifferet Yisrael explains that there was more of a reason to make the gezeira by shofar. Not everyone knows how to blow the shofar. Therefore the Chachamim's concern that a person would take it in order to be taught by someone else is real. This is somewhat similar to the explanation of the Tosfot (Rosh Hashanah 29b, s.v. aval) who explains that lulav is "tiltul be 'alma" (simple handling) whereas shofar is a "maaseh chochma" (more skilled). The Tifferet Yisrael continues that a brit millah for example, is a case where very few people know how to perform the *mitzvah*, yet it can be performed on Shabbat. He provides two answers. One is that shofar is different since everyone is preoccupied with the mitzvah. Consequently, we cannot assumed that someone else will stop him from desecrating Shabbat. Alternatively, with respect to brit millah, those that perform the mitzvah are well trained, so there is no reason to make the gezeira.

After the destruction however, we find that *shofar* is more lenient than *lulav*. In other words, while *lulav* is not taken at all, the *Mishnah* teaches that the *shofar* was blown in a place that had a *Beit Din*. The *Tosfot* explain that since the *shofar* is effective in raising the merits of *Yisrael* before *Hashem*, the *Chachamim* did not want to completely forbid blowing the *shofar*.

Based on this, perhaps we can suggest another explanation why this *gezeira* only applied to the *mitzvah* of *shofar*. Considering the importance of *Rosh Hashanah* and the role of the *shofar*, the concern that one would desperately try and fulfill the *mitzvah* while running the risk of desecrating *Shabbat* is heightened. That is of course unless, as the *Tifferet Yisrael* explained, one is not in the context to ensure that their actions are kept in check.¹

Yisrael Bankier

destruction, when there is no longer the *nissuch ha'mayim*, that one may feel more desperate to full the *mitzvah* of *lulav* that the concern is heightened and the *gezeira* preventing fulfilling the *mitzvah* would apply.

¹ One could suggest that this is also why the concern regarding *lulav* is heightened after the destruction. As we have learnt, it is during *sukkot* that we are judged for rain. Also, we know that there is an association between shaking the *lulav* and rain (see *Sukkah* 37b). Perhaps then, it is after the

Revision Questions

r: r' = r'ראש השנה גי

- What qualifies as a *shofar*? (ג': ב'י)
- Describe the ideal *shofar*? (גי: גי)
- Explain how the *shofar* would coordinate with the *chatzotzrot* in the *Beit Ha'Mikdash* on *Rosh Hashanah*. (ג': ג'ג')
- Explain how the *shofar* would coordinate with the *chatzotzrot* in the *Beit Ha'Mikdash* on a *ta'anit*. (ג'י:ד'ג)
- In what respects was the *tekiyot* on *yovel* similar to those on *Rosh Hashanah*? (ג': ה')
- Can a *shofar* that cracked and was glued together be used? (*t*): (*t*)
- If a *shofar* had a hole in it and was filled in, may it be used? ('1: '1')
- Can someone fulfil their obligation by hearing the echo produced from a shofar? ('\tau:'\tau)
- If someone walked past a *shul* and heard the sound of the *shofar* has he fulfilled his obligation? ('\tau:\tau'\tau)
- How does the Mishnah explain the following pasuk: (גי:חי)
 ייוהיה כאשר ירים משה ידו וגבר ישראל...י (שמות ייז: יייא)
- Which other *pasuk* does the *Mishnah* explain in a similar manner? (ג':חי)
- When was the mitzvah of shofar different inside and outside the Beit Ha'Mikdash? (ד':אין)
- What decree did *R' Yochanan ben Zakkai* enact after the destruction of the *Beit Ha'Mikdash*? (Include both opinions.) (די:אי)
- What was the difference between *Yavneh* and the *Beit Ha'Mikdash* with respect to the *halachot* of *shofar*? (די:בי)
- What other *mitzvah* also has distinct laws between the inside and outside the *Beit Ha'Mikdash* like *shofar?* (כדי בעי)
- What decree did *R' Yochanan ben Zakkai* enact after the destruction of the *Beit Ha'Mikdash* with respect to *Kiddush HaChodesh*? (די:די)
- List the two opinions regarding the order of the *brachot* of *mussaf* on *Rosh Hashanah* and the location of the *tekiyot*? (יה: יהי)
- How many p'sukim are recited for malchiyot, zichronot and shofarot?
 ('1: '7')
- Which *chazzan* recites *Hallel* on *Rosh Hashanah*? (די: יוֹ

Shiurim

ONLINE SHIURIM

Yisrael Bankier mishnahyomit.com/shiurim

Rabbi Reuven Spolter mishnah.co

Rabbi Chaim Brown www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

Rabbi E. Kornfeld Rabbi C. Brown http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calend ars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm

APPS

Mishnah Yomit mishnahyomit.com

All Mishnah Orthodox Union

Mishna Yomi Our Somayach, South Africa

Kehati

SHIUR ON KOL HALOSHON

Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss In US dial: 718 906 6400 Then select: 1-2-4

Next Week's Mishnayot...

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
27 August יי אלול	28 August ייא אלול	29 August ייב אלול	30 August ייג אלול	31 August ייד אלול	1 September טייו אלול	2 September טייז אלול
Rosh Hashanah 4:8-9	Taanit 1:1-2	Taanit 1:3-4	Taanit 1:5-6	Taanit 1:7-2:1	Taanit 2:2-3	Taanit 2:4-5

