



## More Shade than Sunlight

This week we started learning *masechet Sukkah*. The *Mishnah* (1:1) teaches that if the *sukkah* has more sunlight than shade then the *sukkah* is invalid. We shall try to understand this law.

The *Bartenura* notes that if the sunlight and shade were equal, then the *sukkah* would be valid. He explains that this is because we are referring to the sunlight and shade on the floor of the *sukkah*. If the two are equal there, one can be certain that there is more *schach* than empty space. It would seem then that what is important is that the *sukkah* is mostly covered with *schach*. The amount of shade is simply indicative of whether that requirement has been met. Indeed this understanding aligns with the *Rambam* (5:19) who explains that if the amount of *schach* is more than the space between them, then the *sukkah* is valid.

*Rashi* (as explained by the *Ran*) however explains that once the shade on the floor is in the minority, it is annulled and considered as if it is not there. *Rashi* continues that it invalidates the *sukkah* since “it is by way of the *schach* that the [a *sukkah*] is referred to as a *sukka*”. It would seem then that the shade is what is important. Without the required effect of the *schach*, the *sukkah* would be invalid.

The *Sefat Emet* brings a support for the *Ran* from the following question. Normally we only say that the minority is annulled in the majority when the minority is not discernible. Our *Mishnah* however does not appear to be a classic case of such a mixture. How then

can the concept of *bitul* (annulment) apply in our case? The *Sefat Emet* explains that this why the *Ran* asserts that the *bitul* that *Rashi* refers to relates the sunlight and shade itself rather than the physical *schach*. Since sunlight and shade do not have material substance *bitul* is relevant in this case.

Perhaps an intermediate approach can be found in the *Meiri*. The *Meiri* explains that if the cover of *schach* is so light such that there is more sunlight than shade it is as if there is no *schach*. This approach appears to combine elements of both the above explanations. The effect, the shade, is what is important. Yet if it is insufficient, it is the *schach* that is annulled.

The *Porat Yosef* explain that a practical difference between these approaches is found in the case of a two-story *sukkah*. We will learn that if one makes a *sukkah* underneath another *sukkah* then the bottom *sukkah* is invalid. If however the top *sukkah* is covered with *schach* such that its covering and space are equal, then whether the bottom *sukkah* is valid depends on the different understandings above. If we say it is the *schach* that is annulled, then the bottom *sukkah* would be valid since it is not considered a *sukkah* that is underneath another one – there is no *schach* on the top *sukkah*. If however the shade is what is annulled and that invalidates the *schach* for the top *sukkah*, the top *sukkah* is still covered albeit with invalid *schach*. The bottom *sukkah* would still be defined as a *sukkah* underneath another *sukkah* and be invalid.

*Yisrael Bankier*

## Revision Questions

ימא ז: ג'-ט'

- After changing back into the “golden” clothing, how many animals did the *kohen gadol* sacrifice? (ז: ג')
- Why did the *kohen gadol* change again into his “white” clothes? (ז: ד')
- What did the *kohen gadol* do after changing again back into his “gold” clothes? (ז: ד')
- What were the four garments worn by all *kohanim*? (ז: ה')
- How many extra garments did the *kohen gadol* wear and what were they? (ז: ה')
- When would they confer with the *urim ve'tumim*? (ז: ו')
- What is prohibited from doing on *Yom Kippur*? (ז: ז')
- Who does *R' Eliezer* exempt from some of these prohibitions? (ז: ז')
- How much food has one eaten and how much food has one drunk one *Yom Kippur* if they are *chayav*? (ז: ח')
- Does food and drink combine to make up this measure? (ז: ח')
- How many *korbanot chatat* would one be obligated to bring if they forgot it was *Yom Kippur* and: (ז: ח')
  - Ate and drank?
  - Ate and performed a *melacha*?
- How long before a child's *bar-* or *bat-mitzvah* does one begin teaching them to fast on *Yom Kippur*? (ז: ט')
- How does one determine how much food to feed a sick person if there is no doctor available to consult? (ז: ט')
- Complete the following phrase: (ז: ט')
 

"\_\_\_\_\_ ספק נפשות \_\_\_\_\_"
- What case appears in the next *Mishnah* that is a practical example of the principle described in the previous question? (ז: י')
- What else is required for *Yom Kippur* to atone? (ז: י')
- On what sins does *teshuva* instantly atone? (ז: י')
- How does the *Mishnah* respond regarding a person who says “I will sin and then do *teshuva*”? (ז: י')
- On which sins does *Yom Kippur* atone and which require further action in the individual part? (ז: י')
- What does *R' Akiva* learn from the following *p'sukim*:
 

"זורקתי עליכם מים טהורים" (יחזקאל ל"ו: כ"ה)  
"מקוה ישראל" (ירמיה י"ז: ג')

סוכה א': א'-ב'

- What are the maximum and minimum heights of a *sukkah*? (א: א')
- What are the other two structural specifications of a *sukkah*? (א: א')
- What is a *sukkah yeshana*? (א: א')
- Can one make a *sukkah* under a tree? (א: ב')
- Can one make a two-storey *sukkah*? (א: ב')

## Shiurim

### ONLINE SHIURIM

*Yisrael Bankier*  
mishnahyomit.com/shiurim

*Rabbi Reuven Spolter*  
mishnah.co

*Rabbi Chaim Brown*  
www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

*Rabbi E. Kornfeld*  
*Rabbi C. Brown*  
http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calend  
ars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm

### APPS

*Mishnah Yomit*  
mishnahyomit.com

*All Mishnah*  
Orthodox Union

*Mishna Yomi*  
Our Somayach, South Africa

*Kehati*

### SHIUR ON KOL HALOSHON

*Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss*  
In US dial: 718 906 6400  
Then select: 1 – 2 – 4

## Next Week's Mishnayot...

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
25 June ו' תמוז	26 June ז' תמוז	27 June ח' תמוז	28 June ט' תמוז	29 June י' תמוז	30 June יא תמוז	1 July י"ב תמוז
Sukkah 1:3-4	Sukkah 1:5-6	Sukkah 1:7-8	Sukkah 1:9-10	Sukkah 1:11-2:1	Sukkah 2:2-3	Sukkah 2:4-5

