



Shipping Mei Chatat

The *Mishnah* (9:4) teaches that one is not allowed to transport *mei chatat* or *eifer chatat* (the ashes of the *parah adumah*) in a boat along the river. Similarly, one may not allow it to float on the water or throw it over the river. The *Bartenura* explains that this law is a rabbinic decree that was in response to a case where the *mei chatat* was transported in a boat and a *kezayit*-sized flesh from a corpse – *tumat ha'met* – was found in the boat.

The *Gemara* (*Chagiga* 23a) cites a *beraita* that records a debate regarding the scope of the *gezeira*. The first opinion expands the decree to include crossing the river while riding an animal if all its feet lifted off the ground and argues that the *gezeira* applied to all rivers. *R' Chananya* argues it was limited to the *yarden* river only, since that is where the incident occurred.

The *Tosfot* however finds the motivation for the *gezeira* difficult. The *Gemara* (*Zevachim* 93a) cites a *Beraita* where *R' Elazar* explains that if the *mei chatat* became *tameh* it can still be used. His proof is that we do not require a *niddah* to become *tahor* prior to having the *mei chatat* sprinkled upon her. If *mei chatat* that became *tameh* could still be used, then it seems there is no reason for the *gezeira*.

The *Tosfot* provide two answers. In *Chagiga* they explain that there is a difference regarding how the *mei chatat* become *tameh*. While it is true that in general the *mei chatat* would be fine, our case is different because it became *tameh met*. The *Tosfot* in *Zevachim* however answer that it depends on when it became *tameh*. If it was after *kidush* (after the ashes had already been placed on the water) then it can still be used. In our case, it became *tameh* prior to that point.

The second answer of the *Tosfot* is at first difficult. Our *Mishnah* explains that the *gezeira* did not apply to water that had not yet had *kidush*. According to the *Tosfot's* answer, one would have expected the *Mishnah*

to have taught the opposite: the *gezeira* applies to the spring water but not to *mei chatat*.

The *Chazon Ish* (5:11) answers that the *Chachamim* disagree with *R' Elazar*. In other words, if the *mei chatat* became *tameh* it cannot be used. Our *Mishnah* therefore is according to the *Chachamim*. What the *Tosfot* addresses is how we understand *R' Elazar*. It is difficult to suggest that *R' Elazar* maintained that *gezeira* was never made. We must therefore say that *R' Elazar* understood the *gezeira* differently, and that the incident involved the ashes prior to the *kiddush*, and the *gezeira* therefore only applied to the ashes.

The *Chasdei David* (9:9) however provides a novel answer that also answers another question. Note that while the *gezeira* appears to be limited to match the incident that occurred, the *Mishnah* teaches that the ashes are also covered by the *gezeira*. Why? If the case involved the already prepared *mei chatat*, then why would the *gezeira* also include the ashes?

The *Chasdei David* suggests that the incident was where those involved were rushed and boarded the boat with the water and ashes in hand and performed the *kiddush* on the boat. Consequently, the *gezeira* applied to *mei chatat* since it was already in that state when the *tumah* was discovered. It also applied to the ashes, since it violated the requirement that they only be in a *tahor* place.

The *Chasdei David's* explanation of the incident therefore also answers the difficulty with *Tosfot's* second answer. The water did indeed become *tameh* prior to *kiddush*. Consequently, even *R' Elazar* would agree that it could not be used. Nevertheless, the *gezeira* did not apply to spring water prior to *kiddush* since, as we explained, water alone was not brought on board and not what motivated the *gezeira*.

Revision Questions

פרה ח' – ט' – ז':

- Explain how the phrase "מִטְמַאָדָּה לֹא טְמֵאוּנִי, וְאַתָּה טְמֵאתָנִי" applies to the following:
 - *Vlad ha'tum'ot?* (ח':ה')
 - *Kli cheres?* (ח':ר')
 - *Sheini le'tumah?* (ח':ז')
- Explain the debate regarding which bodies of water have the status of a *mikvah*. (ח':ח')
- Complete *R' Yosi's* ruling regarding the previous question: (ח':ח')

כל הימים מטהר _____, ופוסלין _____, _____, ולקדש מהן _____.
- What is *mayim mukim*? (ח':ט')
- What is *mayim mechatzvim*? (ח':ט')
- Can these types of water be used for *mei chatat*? (ח':ט')
- Why can *mei karmiyon* not be used for *mei chatat*? (ח':י')
- Why can *mei yarden* not be used for *mei chatat*? (ח':י')
- Explain the debate regarding the validity of water for two valid sources that were mixed together. (ח':י')
- Is water whose appearance changed valid? (ח':י"א)
- What is the law regarding using water from a well into which earth fell? (ח':י"א)
- Explain the debate regarding the case where valid water fell into *mei chatat*. (ח':ט')
- What is the law if dew fell into *mei chatat*? (ח':ט')
- What is the law if juice fell into *mei chatat*? (ח':ט')
- What is the law if ink fell into *mei chatat*? (ח':ט')
- What is the law if the following creatures fell into *mei chatat*: (ח':ב')
 - *Shekatzim*?
 - *Chipushit*?
 - A louse?
- What is the law if an animal drunk from the *mei chatat*? (ח':ג')
- What is the law if a bird drunk from the *mei chatat*? (ח':ג')
- Which of the *sheratzim* that drink from *mei chatat* would invalidate it? (ח':ג')
- At what point from when one thinks to drink *mei chatat* and finally drinks it does it invalidate the *mei chatat*? (Include all opinions.) (ח':ד')
- Explain the debate regarding whether one can use invalid *mei chatat* to mix cement. (ח':ה')
- What other debate is similar to the one in the previous question? (ח':ה')
- What restrictions are applied on transporting *mei chatat* across water (and why)? (ח':ט')
- Do these restrictions also apply to water to be used for *mei chatat*? (ח':ט')
- What is the law regarding *eifer* for *mei chatat* that got mixed with regular ashes with respect to *tumah*? (ח':ט')
- Explain the debate regarding whether the mixture can be used for *kiddush mei chatat*. (ח':ט')

Local Shiurim

Melbourne, Australia

Sunday -Thursday

10 minutes before *Mincha*
Mizrachi Shul
 Melbourne, Australia

Friday & Shabbat

10 minutes before *Mincha*
Mizrachi Shul
 Melbourne, Australia

Efrat, Israel

Shiur in English

Sunday -Thursday

Rabbi Mordechai Scharf
 9:00am
Kollel Magen Avraham
 Reemon Neighbourhood

ONLINE SHIURIM

Yisrael Bankier
mishnahyomit.com/shiurim

Rabbi Chaim Brown
www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

Rabbi E. Kornfeld
Rabbi C. Brown
<http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calendars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm>

SHIUR ON KOL HALOSHON

Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss
 In US dial: 718 906 6400
 Then select: 1 – 2 – 4

Next Week's Mishnayot...

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
23 May י"ב סיון	24 May י"ג סיון	25 May י"ד סיון	26 May ט"ו סיון	27 May ט"ז סיון	28 May י"ז סיון	29 May י"ח סיון
Parah 9:8-9	Parah 10:1-2	Parah 10:3-4	Parah 10:5-6	Parah 11:1-2	Parah 11:3-4	Parah 11:5-6

