



Difference Between Arachin and Korbanot

With the beginning of the fourth *perek* we learn about *heseg yad*. We have discussed that the value of an *erech-vow* is fixed; it is listed in the *Torah* and depends on the age and gender of the subject of the *erech-vow*. We now learn that if the person that made the *erech* vow cannot afford that amount of money, he pays whatever he can and thereby discharge himself of the obligation.

The *Mishnah* (4:1) comments that while the obligation varies with the financial standing of the one that made the *erech-vow*, in the world of sacrifices this is not the case. Concerning some *korbanot*, what one must bring also depends on the financial standing of the individual. One example is that of the *metzora*. The *Mishnah* asserts that, unlike *arachin*, in the world of *korbanot* the *korban* is determined by the subject. The *Mishnah* explains that if one sees a poor *metzora* and obligates himself to bring that individual's *korbanot*, then we consider the financial standing of the *metzora* and not the individual how took upon himself to bring the *korbanot*.

R' Yehuda however responds that even in the world of *arachin* we can engineer a parallel case. One case would be if a wealthy individual made an *erech-vow* to bring his own *erech*, and a poor person declares that he wishes to take on that obligation. In such a case, *R' Yehuda* reasons, we would not look at what this poor person can afford. This is because he has taken upon himself what the wealthy person has obligated himself to pay. The ruling exactly parallels one that obligates themselves with bringing the *korbanot* of a poor or wealthy *metzora*.

The *Rishonim* differ in their understanding of this *Mishnah*. The *Rambam* appears to understand that *R' Yehuda* is not arguing with the *Chachamim*, rather adding to their explanation.

The *Tosfot* (17a, s.v. *aval*) however explains that the *R' Yehuda* and the *Chachamim* argue. In other words, even in a case where the poor person overheard the wealthy person making an *erech-vow* and the poor person responded by taking on the wealthy person's obligation, the *Chachamim* maintain that we would still consider what the poor person could afford when determining what the second person is obligated to pay.

According to the *Tosfot* how do we understand the position of the *Chachamim*? In both cases it appears that an individual is attempting to take on the obligation of another, and what the other person is obligated to bring depends on his financial status. Yet for *korbanot* the obligation of the one who made the *neder* is determined by the financial status of the subject (the first person), whereas for *arachin*, the standing of the one that made the *neder* is important (the second). What is the difference between *korbanot* and *arachin*?

The *Chazon Ish* (*Kodshim* p350, s.v. *Arachin*) explains that the difference between *korbanot* and *arachin* is that with the latter, the second person could have taken on the *erech-vow* directly themselves. That being the case, the second person is treated as if he made the original *neder*. Even though the second person stipulated that he wants to bring the first's obligation, it is not considered that this is a business obligation between two parties. Instead it is considered as a direct obligation the second person is making to *hekdesh*. One can make such a commitment to *hekdesh* to pay what his friend owes, just like he can commit to donate any sum of money to *hekdesh*. Consequently, if the first person was wealthy and the second poor, the second is only obligated to pay what he can under the framework of an *erech-vow* and the first person must then pay what remains of his obligation. If however the first person was poor and the second wealthy, the wealthy one must pay the full amount of the *erech-vow* as any wealthy person who makes an *erech-vow*, even if it is in excess of the amount the first person can afford.

Revision Questions

ערכין ב' ה' - ה' ג'

- At least how many sheep (inspected for blemishes) had to be in the specially allocated storeroom and why? (בי:ה')
- In the *Beit Ha'Mikdash* what was the minimum and maximum number of:
 - Trumpets?
 - Harps?
 - Cymbals? (בי:ה')
 - *Levi'im* in the choir? (בי:ו')
- How could the young *levi'im* contribute in the *Beit Ha'Mikdash*? (בי:ו')
- Describe how in there is both a leniency and stringency in the following legal categories:
 - *Erchin* as opposed to *Nedarim*. (גי:א')
 - *Sde Achuza* as opposed to *Sde Mikneh*. (Include both opinions) (בי:ב')
 - A *Shor Mu'ad* that killed an *eved* as opposed to another person. (גי:ג')
 - *Ones U'Mefateh*. (די:א')
 - *Motzi Shem Ra'ah*. (גי:ה')
- What example is brought to demonstrate that the punishment for the spoken word is greater than a physical act? (גי:ה')
- How is an *erech*-vow ordinarily calculated both in terms of value and timing? (ד':א')
- What is the case of *heseg-yad* and how is the value determined? (ד':א')
- In what way is the calculation of an *erech*-vow different to one that vowed to bring a *korban* obligated to be brought by another (a *metzorah*)? (די:ב')
- About which case is there a debate about *heseg yad* for one whose financial status changed in between the time of making an *erech*-vow and fulfilling it? (די:ב')
- What is the law in the other cases? (די:ב')
- How does the law in the previous question differ compared to the law of *heseg yad* by *korbanot*? (גי:ד')
- What is the law if someone made an *erech*-vow and the subject's age then changed before it was fulfilled, placing the subject in a different age bracket? (די:ד')
- What age bracket does an exactly twenty year old fit into: 5-20 or 20-60? (ד':ד')
- What is the objection to the ruling in the previous question and based on what is the ruling confirmed? (ד':ד')
- What is the law if the person vows to volunteer his "weight" to the *Beit Ha'Mikdash*? (ה':ה')
- If a person volunteers to donate the weight of his hand how is it determined? (Provide both opinions.) (ה':ה')
- If someone volunteers to donate the value of their hand how is the value determined? (ה':ה')
- In what way are the laws of *erchin* stricter than *nedarim* and in what way are they more lenient? (בי:ה')
- What is the law if someone volunteers to donate the *erech* of their head? (בי:ה')
- What is the difference if the person volunteers to donate using the following language: (גי:ה')
 - "Half my *erech*" or "the *erech* of half of me"?
 - "Half my value" or "the value of half of me"?

Melbourne, Australia

Sunday -Thursday
10 minutes before *Mincha*
Mizrachi Shul
Melbourne, Australia

Friday & Shabbat
10 minutes before *Mincha*
Mizrachi Shul
Melbourne, Australia

Efrat, Israel
Shiur in English

Sunday -Thursday
Rabbi Mordechai Scharf
9:00am
Kollel Magen Avraham
Reemon Neighbourhood

ONLINE SHIURIM

Yisrael Bankier
mishnahyomit.com/shiurim

Rabbi Chaim Brown
www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

Rabbi E. Kornfeld
Rabbi C. Brown
<http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calendars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm>

SHIUR ON KOL HALOSHON

Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss
In US dial: 718 906 6400
Then select: 1 - 2 - 4

Next Week's Mishnayot...

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
19 April כ"ה ניסן	20 April כ"ו ניסן	21 April כ"ז ניסן	22 April כ"ח ניסן	23 April כ"ט ניסן	24 April ל' ניסן	25 April א' אייר
Erchin 5:4-5	Erchin 5:6-6:1	Erchin 6:2-3	Erchin 6:4-5	Erchin 7:1-2	Erchin 7:3-4	Erchin 7:5-8:1

