



## Mevatel Kli Me'heichano

The *Mishnah* (3:6) teaches that one may not place a utensil beneath a lamp to catch the dripping oil. The *Bartenura* explains that since the oil is *muktzeh*, it would be equivalent to being “*mevatel kli me'heichano*”. In other words, one is now preventing the utensil for being used, which one is prohibited from doing. We shall try to understand this prohibition and how it arises in this case.

The *Bartenura* explains that the issue of *mevatel kli me'heichano* is because the utensil can no longer be moved. Consequently, it is as if the *kli* has been cemented down (albeit for *halachic* reasons) and therefore resembles a *melacha* - construction. *Rashi* (*Shabbat* 154b) however explains that the result resembles a different *melacha* - demolishing - since the *kli* is no longer fit for purpose.

How do we understand how the oil is being *mevatel kli me'heichano*? *Rashi* explains that since the oil is *muktzeh*, the *kli* becomes *muktzeh* too as it is a *basis le'davar assur* – a base serving something that is prohibited to move. It appears that that the law of *basis le'davar assur* applies even if the *muktzeh* item was placed there during *Shabbat*. Indeed the *Tosfot Rid* (154b) understands that were it not the case, then one could simply shake the oil off the *kli* when he needed it and it should not then be considered *mevatel kli me'heichano*. The *Beit Yosef* cites the *Ran* as another *Rishon* that maintains this position.

The *Baal HaMeor* (*Shabbat* 154b) however argues that a *kli* only becomes a *basis le'davar assur* if the *davar assur* was on the *kli* during *bein ha'shamashot* (between sunset and night fall) on *erev Shabbat*. In other words, the fact that this oil has dripped on the plate does not make it a *basis le'davar assur*. He explains that if a *davar assur* falls on the *kli* during *Shabbat* then the *kli* is not *muktzeh*. One can simply pick it up and shake off the *davar assur*. This would be true also if one placed the *kli* in order to

catch a *davar assur*, but did so with the intention of shaking it off soon after. The cases where *mevatel kli me'hachano* is an issue is where one intends to leave the *davar assur* on it for the rest of *Shabbat*. In other words, the problem with placing the *kli* under the dripping oil is that one intends to leave it there for the rest of *Shabbat*.

Based on this understands, we find an interesting distinction raised by the *Magen Avraham* (265:2). He quotes the *Haghot Ashri* who explains that the law in our *Mishnah* only applies if the *kli* was placed there to catch the oil. If however it was placed there to catch dripping wax then it would be permitted. What is the difference? He explains, that regarding wax, one could simply shake the wax off. Regarding oil however, one would be reluctant to do so in order to preserve the oil.

The *Magen Avraham* however notes that there are some *Rishonim* that prohibit one being *mevatel kli me'heichano* even temporarily. Nevertheless, he notes that while this point is debated, in cases of *hefsed* (loss) everyone agrees it is permitted temporarily. Consequently, in the case of dripping wax, where there is a concern of (*chas ve'shalom*) a fire, then everyone would agree that it is permitted. Nevertheless, he cites the *Maharil* who explains that licence of *hefsed* is only if there is a clear and present danger.

The *Mishnah Berurah* (265:5) cites the *Magen Avraham* to raise a further distinction. He explains that while one would be able to place the *kli* in order to catch wax, one would not be able to catch the burning wicks that might fall. The difference is that if the wax falls, one would be able to shake it off immediately. With respect to the falling wicks, since one must wait for the wicks to burn out prior to shaking them off, it would be considered temporarily being *mevatel kli me'heichano* and therefore prohibited.

*Yisrael Bankier*

**Revision Questions**

שבת ב' א' – ד' א'

- The first *Mishnah* in the second *perek* lists things with which one is not allowed to use as *Shabbat* candles (either as wicks or as fuel). What is the reason why these things are excluded? (ב' א')
- Can *shemen sreifa* be used for *Shabbat* candles on *Yom Tov*? (ב' ג')
- Why does *R' Yishmael* prohibit the use of *itrان* for *Shabbat* candles? (ב' ג')
- The *Chachamim* allow all oils to be used for *Shabbat* candles, *R' Tarfon* only allows one – which is it? (ב' ג')
- Which is the only substance that comes from a tree that can be used as wicks in *Shabbat* candles? (ג' א')
- For which other law is this substance an exception? (ג' א')
- The *Chachamim* and *R' Yehuda* argue about the validity of two contraptions for use as *Shabbat* candles – describe them. (ב' ד')
- For what four reasons can one put out candles on *Shabbat*? (ב' ה')
- Which three *mitzvot* are women entrusted with? (ב' ו')
- Which three things must a person check have been completed prior to *Shabbat*? (ב' ו')
- Which three things does the *Mishnah* list as being prohibited during *bein ha'shmashot* and which three things are permissible? (ב' ז')
- Under what conditions can one leave food on the stove as *Shabbat* comes in? (ג' א')
- With respect to the previous question, *Beit Shammai* and *Beit Hillel* argue on two points – what are they? (א' א')
- What is a *tanur* and what is a *kofach* and how do they differ with respect to the previously described case? (ג' ב')
- Explain the debate regarding whether one can cook an egg in a utensil that has been left in the sun. (ג' ג')
- What was the innovation implemented by the people of *Teveria* and what was the *Chachamim's* reaction? (ג' ד')
- Can one put cold water into a container that has recently been emptied of its boiling hot water? (ג' ה')
- When can one place a plate under the *Shabbat* candles to catch the oil? (ג' ו')
- What must one be careful about when placing a plate under a candle to catch the sparks? (ג' ו')
- The first *Mishnah* in the fourth *perek* lists things with which one is not allowed to insulate hot food on *erev Shabbat*. What is the reason why these things are excluded? (ד' א')

**Melbourne, Australia**

**Sunday -Thursday**

10 minutes before *Mincha*  
Mizrachi Shul  
 Melbourne, Australia

**Friday & Shabbat**

10 minutes before *Mincha*  
Mizrachi Shul  
 Melbourne, Australia

**Efrat, Israel**

*Shiur in English*

**Sunday -Thursday**

Rabbi Mordechai Scharf  
 9:00am  
Kollel Magen Avraham  
 Reemon Neighbourhood

**ONLINE SHIURIM**

*Yisrael Bankier*  
[mishnahyomit.com/shiurim](http://mishnahyomit.com/shiurim)

*Rabbi Chaim Brown*  
[www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/](http://www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/)

*Rabbi E. Kornfeld*  
*Rabbi C. Brown*  
<http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calendars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm>

**SHIUR ON KOL HALOSHON**

*Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss*  
 In US dial: 718 906 6400  
 Then select: 1 – 2 – 4

**Next Week's Mishnayot...**

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
26 February ל' שבט	27 February א' אדר	28 February ב' אדר	1 March ג' אדר	2 March ד' אדר	3 March ה' אדר	4 March ו' אדר
Shabbat 2:1-2	Shabbat 2:3-4	Shabbat 2:5-6	Shabbat 2:7-3:1	Shabbat 3:2-3	Shabbat 3:4-5	Shabbat 3:6-4:1

