



Volume 10. Issue 39

## Bread Baking Gone Wrong

*Asheira* was a form of idol-worship (*avoda zara*) that involved people worshipping a tree (3:7). As we have already learnt one is prohibited from gaining any benefit from *avoda zara*. The *Mishnah* (3:9) taught that with respect to an *asheira* tree one would not be able to get any benefit from its wood<sup>1</sup>. The *Mishnah* also taught that if one used the wood of an *asheira* tree to fuel an oven and bake bread, then no benefit may be gained from the bread either. The *Bartenura* explains that this is when the bread was baking while the wood was burning and the bread was gaining benefit while the forbidding wood was visible.

The *Mishnah* continues with a debate regarding what to do if the forbidden loaf was mixed with many others. Since we are dealing with the prohibition of *avoda zara* the laws of *bitul* do not apply. Consequently the first opinion is that the entire mixture is forbidden. *R' Eliezer* however offers another solution: "cast the benefit in the dead sea". In other words set aside money equivalent to the benefit and dispose of it in the Dead Sea. The *Chachamim* however take issue with this responding that the prohibition of *avoda zara* cannot simply be "redeemed" and transferred to money. In other words, since everyone agrees that redemption with money cannot permit an object of idol worship, this case should be no different.

According to *R' Eliezer*, how is the benefit being calculated? The *Tosfot Yom* addresses this question in detail. The *Bartenura* and *Rambam* maintain that it is the value of the forbidden loaf. The *Ran* however finds this difficult since the *Mishnah* should have taught, "the value of one of them [i.e. the loaves] is cast to the Dead Sea"; instead it refers to "the benefit". He argues, it is the benefit of the provided by the forbidden wood that was used.

Similarly, the *Rosh* asserts that once the benefit of the actual forbidden item (*issur*), i.e. the wood, is removed then it should be permitted. He adds however that this solution of "redeeming" the *issur* was only made possible if the bread was mixed with other loaves. The *Ran* explains that we find similarities with respect to *yayin nesech* (wine used for idol worship) when explaining the position that the technique cannot be used when dealing with the single loaf alone. With respect to a mixture of wine with *yayin nesech* in one container, one cannot sell the mixture to a non-Jew excluding the value of the *yayin nesech*.

The *Ran* himself however maintains that *R' Eliezer's* technique can be use on the single loaf alone. He explains that there is a difference between our case and the case of the *yayan nesech*. In the latter case, the object of *issur* is part of the mixture – the *yayin nesech* itself. In our case, it is only the benefit of the heat generated from the forbidden wood that is mixed into the bread and not the wood itself. Consequently the *Ran* understands that the redemption can be made even before any further mixtures.

This distinction as described by the *Ran* arises with respect to another debate. After the redemption there is a discussion as to what is permitted. According to the *Ritva* one can gain benefit from the bread (e.g. sell it) but not eat it. A parallel is found with *yayin nesech*, that if one barrel is mixed with many others, they can all be sold for a price that excludes the value of one barrel. There, benefit is permitted but not consumption. *Rabbeinu Yona* however maintains that our case is different since none of the actual *issur* is in the bread, consequently once redeemed it may be eaten.

*Yisrael Yitzchak Bankier*

<sup>1</sup> The *Tifferet Yisrael* explains that this is only if an *Yisrael* cuts the wood. If an *Akum* did, he would have annulled the idol by the act of cutting wood and the wood would therefore be permitted.

### Revision Questions

עבודה זרה ב' ז': ד' ג'

- List five items belonging to *goyim* that are permissible to eat? (ב' ז')
- From which type of *chagavim* must one take *trumah*? (ב' ז')
- Explain the opinions of *R' Meir, Chachamim and R' Shimon Ben Gamliel* regarding *tzelamim*? (א' ג')
- What individual pieces of a *tzelem* are *mutar* and which are *assur*? (ב' ג')
- What *keilim* must be destroyed according to: (ג' ג')
  - Tana Kama*
  - R' Shimon Ben Gamliel*
  - R' Yosi*
- What question was posed to *R' Gamliel* by *Proklos Ben Plospfos*? (ד' ג')
- What was *R' Gamliel's* first answer to this question? (ד' ג')
- What was *R' Gamliel's* second response? (ד' ג')
- Explain the debate regarding if mountains and valleys used for *avodah zara* are *mutar*. (ה' ג')
- According to *R' Yosi* why is an *Asheira* tree *pasul*? (ה' ג')
- If someone had the wall of their house adjoining that of an idol worshipper and it fell, how should it be rebuilt? (ו' ג')
- Explain the opinion of *R' Akiva* with regard to the *tum'ah* of *avodah zara*. (ג' ז')
- The *Mishnah* discusses three scenarios which can arise with an item used for *Avodah Zara*. What are the scenarios and what are the three possible outcomes? (ז' ג')
- Explain the *machloket* between *Tana Kama* and *R' Shimon* with regard to an *Asheira* tree. (ז' ג')
- If one crossed under an *Asheira* tree that hung over public property would he be *tamei* or *tahor*? (ח' ג')
- What benefit does one get from planting vegetables in the shade of an *Asheira* tree in the winter according to *R' Yosi*? (ח' ג')
- What must be done to a new oven if it was heated up with wood from on *Asheira* tree? (ט' ג')
- Explain the *machloket* between *R' Eliezer* and *Chachamim* regarding *pidyon* for *avodah zara*. (ט' ג')
- Is one able to nullify an *Asheira* tree? How? (י' ג')
- According to *R' Yishmael* if one found two rocks beside a *Markulis* are they *mutar*? (יא' ז')
- When do the *Chachamim* make rocks found by a *Markulis* *assur*? (יא' ד')
- What type of items, if found on an *avodah zara* are always forbidden? (יא' ב')
- In what situation may one benefit from the garden or bath-house of an *avodah zara*? (יא' ג')

### Local Shiurim

#### Melbourne, Australia

**Sunday -Thursday**  
10 minutes before *Mincha*  
Mizrachi Shul  
Melbourne, Australia

**Friday & Shabbat**  
10 minutes before *Mincha*  
Beit Ha'Roeh  
Melbourne, Australia

---

#### Efrat, Israel

*Shiur in English*

**Sunday -Thursday**  
Rabbi Mordechai Scharf  
9:00am  
Kollel Magen Avraham  
Reemon Neighbourhood

---

#### ONLINE SHIURIM

*Rabbi Chaim Brown*  
[www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/](http://www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/)

*Rav Meir Pogrow*  
[613.org/mishnah.html](http://613.org/mishnah.html)

*Rabbi E. Kornfeld*  
*Rabbi C. Brown*  
<http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calendars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm>

---

#### SHIUR ON KOL HALOSHON

*Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss*  
In US dial: 718 906 6400  
Then select: 1 – 2 – 4

### Next Week's Mishnayot...

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
10 <sup>th</sup> November ז' כסלו	11 <sup>th</sup> November ח' כסלו	12 <sup>th</sup> November ט' כסלו	13 <sup>th</sup> November י' כסלו	14 <sup>th</sup> November יא' כסלו	15 <sup>th</sup> November י"ב כסלו	16 <sup>th</sup> November י"ג כסלו
Avodah Zara 4:4-5	Avodah Zara 4:6-7	Avodah Zara 4:8-9	Avodah Zara 4:10-11	Avodah Zara 4:12-5:1	Avodah Zara 5:2-3	Avodah Zara 5:4-5

